

5-1-1978

[Book Review of] *Genetics and the Law*, edited by Aubrey Milunski and George J. Annas

Thomas J. Shannon

Follow this and additional works at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq>



Part of the [Ethics and Political Philosophy Commons](#), and the [Medicine and Health Sciences Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Shannon, Thomas J. (1978) "[Book Review of] *Genetics and the Law*, edited by Aubrey Milunski and George J. Annas," *The Linacre Quarterly*: Vol. 45: No. 2, Article 24.

Available at: <http://epublications.marquette.edu/lnq/vol45/iss2/24>

May's treatment is marked by close fidelity to official Catholic teaching. Where such teaching is nonexistent on a particular matter, he relies heavily on the insights of Ramsey and Grisez, while frequently disassociating himself from the views of Curran, Dedek, Haring and Maguire. The result is that May rejects as ethically untenable a number of the new reproductive technologies, e.g., artificial insemination (both AIH and AID), *in vitro* fertilization, and cloning. He similarly finds ethically unacceptable artificial contraception, abortion (including the pre-implantation period), direct sterilization, direct euthanasia, and suicide.

Physicians, nurses, and other health-care professionals will find many points of interest and practical importance in this book, among them discussions of: proxy consent for nontherapeutic experimentation of children (a negative critique of McCormick's position), the procreative and unitive aspects of sexual activity (a rebuttal of the ethics of the CTSA "Human Sexuality" report), the uses of amniocentesis, the fertilization-implantation dispute (a rejection of the stand of Dr. J. Diamond), periodic abstinence and its alleged relationship to spontaneous abortion (a repudiation of Haring's views) and the Karen Quinlan case (May believes the N. J. Supreme Court ruling is a step toward the legalization of the ethics of euthanasia). The more philosophically inclined reader will find May's treatment of the "ethics of proportionate good" helpful in understanding how it is that contemporary ethicists, by starting with different ethical methodologies, can arrive at such different conclusions.

May writes with forthrightness, clarity and a wide acquaintance with both the scientific and ethical literature. His cogent restatement of traditional Catholic positions and the reasons behind them will be welcomed by the many who hold these positions; hopefully, it will also reveal to those who are prone to dismiss these views as the merely arbitrary impositions of an authoritarian Church the important values that the Church has tried to protect by its teaching. For this reason his book is a worthwhile addition to current bioethical literature and is deserving of wide reading and discussion.

— James J. Doyle, C.S.C.
King's College

Genetics and the Law

Aubrey Milunsky and George J. Annas, editors

Plenum Press, 227 W. 17th St., New York, N.Y. 10010, 1976. xii + 532 pp., no price given.

The results of a national symposium on genetics and law held in 1975, this volume presents the papers delivered, the responses, and discussion from the floor. There are five major selections: 1) the fetus and the newborn, 2) genetic counseling, with an emphasis on screening, 3) genetics and family law, 4) research and experimentation focusing on *in vitro* fertilization and cloning, and 5) a section on eugenics, ethics, law and society. These topics are discussed by the leading experts in the various fields. The vast majority of the papers are excellent, either pushing an argument further or helping to clarify a confused issue. Others, few in number, are brief statements of problems that are introductory and consequently superficial. Also, the responses and discussions of the papers are uneven, as one would expect, and they could easily have been omitted. The majority of the articles have

excellent references and an up-to-date bibliography is provided. The scope of topics covered in this volume together with the general competence with which they are presented and the excellent references make this a valuable resource, both for general reading and class use.

The issues are presented fairly, which does not suggest a lack of either passion or commitment on the part of the authors. Many differences of opinion emerge and by the time the reader finishes a section, he or she will have been exposed to most of the major problems. The legal thrust of the volume, in particular, helps many issues of public policy to be examined and explored in ways that are absent from many such discussions, and this adds an extremely valuable dimension to this volume.

Although no price is listed on this second printing, the first printing carried a price of \$22.50. It is most unfortunate that this valuable volume must sell for so much, especially since it emerged from a conference. Purchase of the volume will be a good investment, however, since many of the articles help set the standard for future discussion of these issues.

— Thomas A. Shannon
Department of Humanities, Worcester Polytechnic Institute

BOOKS RECEIVED

- Ethical Issues in Sex Therapy and Research.** W. Masters, V. Johnson, R. Kolodny. Little, Brown and Co., Boston. 1977, xix + 227 pp., \$12.50.
- Gift of Life: The Social and Psychological Impact of Organ Transplantation.** R. G. Simmons, S. Klein, R. L. Simmons. John Wiley & Sons, New York. 1977, x + 526 pp., \$22.95.
- Health as a Human Value.** Society for Health and Human Values, Philadelphia. 1977, 49 pp., no price given.
- How To Understand And Overcome Depression.** Earnest Larsen, C.S.S.R. Liguori Publications, Liguori, Mo. 1977, 129 pp., \$1.95.
- Infanticide.** Effie A. Quay. Sun Life, Thaxton, Va. 1977, 31 pp., \$.50.
- Medical/Moral Problems.** Robert Heyer, editor. Paulist Press, New York. 1978, 64 pp., \$1.75.
- The Position of Modern Science on the Beginning of Human Life.** Scientists For Life. Sun Life, Thaxton, Va. 1975, 47 pp., \$1.00
- The Self and Its Brain: An Argument for Interactionism.** Karl Popper, John Eccles. Springer International, New York. 1977, xvi + 597 pp., \$17.90.
- Sexual Morality: A Catholic Perspective.** Philip S. Keane, S.S. Paulist Press, New York. viii + 236 pp., \$8.50.
- A Symbolic Triangle: Hippocrates, Psyche, and Pandora.** Bernard V. Dryer, M.D. Society for Health and Human Values. 1978, 27 pp., no price given.
- Talking It Out: A Guide to Effective Communication.** Joseph M. Strayhorn, Jr. Research Press Co., Champaign, Ill. 1977, 192 pp., \$4.95.