

1-1-1998

Messages of Individualism in French, Spanish, and American Television Advertising

Ronald E. Taylor
University of Tennessee, Knoxville

Joyce M. Wolburg
Marquette University, joyce.wolburg@marquette.edu

Messages of Individualism in French, Spanish, and American Television Advertising

Ronald E. Taylor
Joyce M. Wolburg

Individualism is a central value in French, Spanish, and American cultures. However, what it means to be an individual and how this is expressed varies among cultures. This study explores the ways that television advertising reflects individualism in French, Spanish, and American cultures and uses a qualitative approach that allows coding categories to emerge from the three countries' samples rather than imposing previously defined categories from a single culture.

The study identifies six main advertising message strategies across the three cultures: the Efficient Individual, the Sensual Individual, the Attractive/Healthy Individual, the Esteemed Individual, the Performant(e) Individual, and the Intellectual Individual. The six strategies vary in frequency with some claims used more than others. Differences within cultures are also identified and implications for the issues of standardization and specialization are discussed.

Ronald E. Taylor (Ph.D. University of Illinois) is professor and head of the Department of Advertising at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville. His research has appeared in the Journal of Advertising, Journalism Quarterly, and Health Marketing Quarterly.

Joyce M. Wolburg (Ph.D. University of Tennessee) is assistant professor in the Department of Advertising and Public Relations at Marquette University. Other research articles are forthcoming in the Journal of Advertising and Research in Marketing.

An earlier version of this article was presented in Chicago at the national conference of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication in 1997. The study was funded by a research award from the University of Tennessee.

The authors wish to thank the editor and the anonymous reviewers for their thoughtful contributions and suggestions.

Individualism is widely accepted as one of the core values in American culture (Lodge, 1975; Hofstede, 1991; Triandis, 1989). Lodge defines it as the belief that "fulfillment lies in an essentially lonely struggle in what amounts to a wilderness where the fit survive — and where, if you do not survive, you are somehow unfit" (p. 10). Like all values, individualism is thought to be pervasive and reflected in society's institutions as well as in its cultural products such as novels, films, television programs, popular music, and advertising. Yet, the pervasive, taken-for-granted nature of values can make

them nearly invisible to the members of a given culture.

What constitutes "individualism" varies from culture to culture. As O'Sullivan et al. (1994) note, "Individualism is rarely discussed in studies of communication, but its assumptions are implicit in a great variety of theorizing on the subject." The following study explicates the ways in which messages of individualism appear in French, Spanish, and American television advertising. The study begins with an overview of individualism in a historical context and proceeds to an interpretive analy-

sis of advertising content. This study is intended neither to be a census of all the ways in which advertisers make use of individualism nor to provide an exact count of the instances of individualism. Rather, it is intended to (1) explore the depth and the variation of the portrayal of individualism as an ingrained value, (2) to bring its use to a conscious level, and (3) to make available for discussion the taken-for-granted nature of individualism that is interwoven with advertising messages.

AN OVERVIEW OF INDIVIDUALISM

This overview places individualism in a historical context and summarizes the work of major social scientists who have studied individualism as a cultural value.

Individualism in Historical Context

During medieval times, the concept of individualism had no place in the fixed social hierarchy. Throughout the 15th century, medieval social philosophy was dominated by St. Augustine's explanation that God had assigned each person a fixed place in the community (Nisbet, 1973). Each person was equated with his or her place in this hierarchy, and any separation from the social roles assigned by God, society, and family was unthinkable (Baumeister, 1987).

The early modern era (16th to 18th century) marked increased social mobility and the cessation of the fixed social hierarchy. The blacksmith's son, for example, was no longer tied to the

moral duty to become a blacksmith himself (MacIntyre, 1981). Conceptions of individuality began to be articulated, and the basic unit in society began to shift from the community to the individual. For the first time, it was conceivable that the individual's interests could be in conflict with those of society.

John Locke became England's most prominent spokesman for the religious, political, and economic freedoms. According to Locke, all people (1) were inherently good, (2) were endowed with inalienable rights by god, and (3) held equal privilege in the pursuit of rank. Each person shaped his or her own destiny through personal efforts.

Locke's political philosophy evolved differently in various countries. In England, Locke's ideas were augmented by Jeremy Bentham and John Stuart Mill, and compared to Americans, Britons today place less value on individual competition than upon serving the country's needs (Lodge, 1975). In France, Locke's notions of individualism emerged in the 17th century in the call for freedom, equality, and brotherhood (Hofstede, 1991) but were overtaken by Rousseau's 18th century idea of the General Will, which he defined as the collection of the individual wills of the people (Lodge, 1975). Locke's ideas came to the greatest fruition in the United States during the fight for independence as noted by the following words in the Declaration of Independence, "We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal, that they are endowed by

the Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty, and the pursuit of Happiness" (1776, p. 1).

Individualism is so important in the U.S. that the Bill of Rights and the 14th Amendment of the U.S. Constitution guarantee protection against unjust acts of government that would deprive any person of life, liberty, or property without due process of law. The French political philosopher, Alexis de Tocqueville, coined the word "individualism" in *De la Democratie en Amerique*, which described his experiences and observations of the American people of the 1830s (Miller, 1967). According to de Tocqueville

Individualism is a calm and considered feeling which disposes each citizen to isolate himself from the mass of his fellows and withdraw into the circle of family and friends; with this little society formed to his taste, he gladly leaves the greater society to look after itself (Bellah, 1985, p. 37).

In 1605 Spain's Miguel de Cervantes introduced one of the premises of individualism in *Don Quixote*. A central idea in Cervantes' book is that "each man is the child of his deeds," which privileges virtue over birth. This idea was in direct opposition to the belief among the Spanish aristocracy that inherited nobility determined one's identity (Mariscal, 1991, p. 154). Because Cervantes' work was highly controversial, it was not until the 19th century that it gained a large measure of

acceptance in Spain.

A more recent expression of individualism is reported by Seidman (1996) in his examination of individualistic behavior among Spaniards in Madrid during the Spanish Civil War in 1936-1939. He notes that solidarity was a problem even at the beginning of the war because so many workers were more concerned with self-interest than the common good. Aceves (1971) notes that Spaniards believe in the individual's inalienable right to do as he/she pleases, coupled with the implied obligation that his/her actions do not seriously interfere with the rights of others. He quotes a common expression of individualism, "I lago lo que me de la gana," which is translated as "I'll do that which I feel like doing" (p. 68).

How Social Scientists See Individualism

The polar opposite of individualism is collectivism, a view that holds that the unit of survival lies in the group, not in the individual. The relative presence of individualism and collectivism within various cultures has been discussed by many researchers across disciplines. Social psychologist Harry Triandis (1985) suggests that individualism/collectivism is perhaps the most important dimension of cultural differences in social behavior across the diverse cultures of the world because the dimension affects so many institutions in society.

The Dutch social scientist, Geert Hofstede (1980; 1991), has researched the many ways in which individual-

ism and collectivism affect many of these institutions including family life, occupations, education, and relationships in the workplace. He notes that in most collectivistic societies the family consists of many people living closely together — not just the parents and other children, but grandparents, uncles, aunts, and servants. This "extended family" is the only secure protection one has against the hardships of life, and breaking the loyalty to family is one of the most severe offenses a collectivistic person can commit.

While single parent families are commonplace, individualistic families typically consist of two parents, the child, and possibly other children, but other relatives live elsewhere and are not seen often. This "nuclear family" teaches the child to be independent, and children are expected to leave the parental home as soon as they can stand on their own feet. In these societies, once children are independent, they reduce the strength of their relationships with parents. This view of individualism is closely aligned with Lodge's "lonely struggle" because the person in the individualistic culture lacks the secure protection of the extended family against the hardships of life and must survive on his/her own merits.

Hofstede also distinguished among cultures on the basis of communication from "high-context" to "low-context," a dimension previously described by anthropologist Edward T. Hall (1976). High-context communication is typical of collectivistic cultures and requires little

information to be spoken or written because most of the message is assumed as part of the social hierarchy, exists in the physical environment, or is implied by the person. Very little is in the coded, explicit part of the message. In contrast, individualistic cultures typically use low-context communication, which provides most of the information explicitly. The United States and Japan are often contrasted as examples of low-context and high-context, respectively. American contracts, for example, are typically lengthy with details precisely described, while Japanese contracts are very short and inexplicit. The Japanese also place more confidence in verbal, face-to-face agreements than in legal contracts, while that confidence is reversed among Americans, who privilege the written word.

These differences in family, communication, education, occupations, and the workplace as noted by Hofstede are summarized in Exhibit 1, and a more detailed list of characteristics of individualistic cultures is provided in the Appendix. Hofstede further notes that affluent countries are statistically more likely to favor individualism over collectivism because as the wealth increases in a country, people have resources that allow personal expression.

The storyteller in the village market is replaced by TV sets, first one per village, but soon more. In wealthy Western family homes every family member may have his or her own TV set. The caravan through the desert is replaced by a number of

buses, and these by a larger number of motor cars, until each adult family member drives a different car. The village hut in which the entire family lives and

sleeps together is replaced by a house with a number of private rooms. Collective life is replaced by individual life (1991, p. 76).

EXHIBIT 1
Hofstede's Key Differences Between
Collectivist and Individualist Societies

Collectivist	Individualist
People are born into extended families or other ingroups which continue to protect them in exchange for loyalty	Everyone grows up to look after him/herself and his/her immediate (nuclear) family only
Identity is based in the social network to which one belongs	Identity is based in the individual
Children learn to think in terms of 'we'	Children learn to think in terms of 'I'
Harmony should always be maintained and direct confrontations avoided	Speaking one's mind is a characteristic of an honest person
High-context communication	Low-context communication
Trespassing leads to shame and loss of face for self and group	Trespassing leads to guilt and loss of self-respect
Purpose of education is learning how to do	Purpose of education is learning how to learn
Diplomas provide entry to higher status groups	Diplomas increase economic worth and/or self-respect
Employer—employee relationship is perceived in moral terms, like a family link	Employer — employee relationship is a contract supposed to be based on mutual advantage
Hiring and promotion decisions take employees' ingroup into account	Hiring and promotion decisions are supposed to be based on skills and rules only
Management is management of groups	Management is management of individuals
Relationship prevails over task	Task prevails over relationship

Hofstede, 1991, p. 67 [Used by permission]

The Dutch social scientist, Fons Trompenaars (1993), observes that collectivist societies typically make decisions by working to achieve consensus. These societies intuitively refrain from voting because this shows disrespect to the individuals who are against the majority decision. Trompenaars sees consensus seeking as a time-consuming approach but one that usually allows the decision to be implemented smoothly and efficiently. In contrast, individualistic societies typically make decisions by a majority vote -- a practice that leads to a quick resolution, but one that is often difficult to implement.

Individualism in France, the United States, and Spain

In a 40 country study of individualism in the workplace Hofstede (1980) identified the United States, France, and Spain as individualistic. The United States ranked at the top of the list with an individualism score of 91, France ranked 11th with a score of 71, and Spain ranked 20th with a score of 51. At the bottom of the list were Pakistan, Colombia, and Venezuela. While individualism is usually associated with low context cultures such as the United States, there does not appear to be a cause and effect relationship between individualism and low context. For example, France and Spain are high context cultures (Hall and Hall, 1990) that are also high in individualism (Hofstede, 1980).

ADVERTISING AND CULTURE

Cultural values such as individual-

ism are believed to be so ingrained within a culture that all cultural products, including advertising, should reflect the values of a culture in some manner. This section provides a context for understanding the ways in which individualism is promoted through advertising by: (1) noting advertising roles, expenditures, and media penetration across France, Spain, and the U.S., (2) reviewing the literature for advertising and cultural values, (3) noting the connection between values and appeals, (4) recognizing advertising techniques that support individualism, and (5) identifying gaps in the existing research.

Roles, Expenditures, and Media Penetration

As a cultural product, advertising plays different roles within different cultures, according to the expectations that the culture has for it. Hall and Hall (1990), for example, have noted that the role of advertising in the United States is to "hype" the product, in Germany it is to provide information about the product, and in France it is to evoke a response from the viewer. In addition, the amount of money spent on advertising, what is advertised, and where advertising appears is subject to the regulatory mechanisms within each culture. According to 1996 figures for Advertising Age, the United States is the worldwide leader in advertising expenditures at \$160 billion, accounting for almost half of worldwide expenditures. Twenty-three percent of all advertising dollars were allocated to television, which is available in 98%

of homes (Advertising Age, 1996).

Advertisers in France spent \$11.6 billion on advertising in 1994 with 28% of all advertising dollars spent in television, which is available in 97% of French homes (Leo Burnett Co., 1994). In Spain, advertisers spent \$6 billion on advertising with 68% of total advertising expenditures allocated to television. Television is available in 99% of Spanish homes (Leo Burnett Co., 1994).

The Study of Advertising and Cultural Values

Since 1980 the major advertising and marketing journals published more than 20 studies using content analysis of cultural values in ads. Of these studies, several tracked changes in values over time within a single country (Belk & Pollay, 1985a; Belk & Pollay, 1985b; Cheng, 1994; Gross & Sheth, 1989; Pollay, 1984; Pollay & Gallagher, 1990; Zinkhan, Hong, & Lawson, 1990; Zinkhan & Shermohamad, 1986). Others examined values cross-culturally, resulting in comparisons of U.S. advertising with Brazil (Tansey, Hyman, & Zinkhan, 1990), China (Cheng, 1994), Great Britain (Frith & Wesson, 1991), Japan (Mueller, 1987; Belk & Bryce, 1986; Belk & Pollay, 1985c), Mexico (McCarty & Hattwick, 1992), and Sweden (Wiles, Wiles & Tjernlund, 1996). Other international advertising studies have addressed topics such as information content, gender roles, and regulation.

Advertising Values and Appeals

Advertising is a cultural product intended to persuade an audience.

Advertising messages are intended to influence behavior by creating a desire for a product that will ultimately lead to purchase behavior, by influencing public opinion in order to generate votes for a political candidate, or by creating favorable attitudes toward companies to enhance their image, which ultimately may increase sales. In order for these persuasive messages to be effective, advertisers "appeal" to human needs, such as those in Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs (Maslow, 1970). Textbooks of creative advertising list as many as 24 appeal strategies, such as affiliation, security, love, plus 11 different kinds of emotional appeals (Moriarty, 1991). While no hierarchy exists among Moriarty's list of appeals, Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs are ranked from low to high as follows: physiological (food, drink, shelter), safety and security (personal, family), belongingness (love, friendship, affiliation), esteem (peer respect, status, envy), and self-actualization (self-respect, ego, self-expression).

Hofstede observes that Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs reflects Western thinking since the highest goal is self-actualization — above that of affiliation or belonging, which is a central goal in collectivistic cultures. Self-actualization "can only be the supreme motivation in an individualistic society" since in a collectivist culture it is the interest of the group that will be actualized (1991, p. 73).

Advertising Techniques that Support Individualism

One of the ways that messages of individualism are carried to consumers is through the advertising

practice of writing to the individual. Standard American textbooks frequently teach writers to imagine they are writing to just one person. Nelson (1989) recommends that writers speak to a single reader even though ads are reproduced for multiple readership, and attempt to maintain the illusion of a salesman-to-buyer relationship by writing in an informal, conversational, and where appropriate, intimate manner. Nelson suggests that a logical way of developing a one-reader feel in copy is by writing in the second person. "The word you is deservedly commonplace in advertising copy" (p. 152).

Advertising giant David Ogilvy (1985) also instructs copywriters to address the consumer as an individual. Ogilvy says, "When people read your copy, they are alone. Pretend you are writing each of them a letter on behalf of your client. One human being to another; second person singular" (p. 80).

A second technique is the use of camera to provide a first person point-of-view. Called the "subjective camera" in film terminology, the use of camera to create subjectivity facilitates identification with individual members of the audience (Cook, 1985). When the advertising copy is directed to one person, and the camera work reinforces that point-of-view, the combined techniques privilege individualism by encouraging the decision process to be one that consumers make alone or independently of others.

Not only are advertising appeals meaningful to members of a culture

because they tap into basic needs, they are also meaningful because the creative execution of the ads places the appeal within a context that reflects the culture. An ad for a cosmetic product targeted toward women may appeal to the need for attractiveness, but the background cues such as the presence of admiring men provide rich cultural material that may deliver powerful messages of individualism and other core cultural values. These cues are meaningful when considering that the way men and women interact and form relationships differs in collectivistic and individualistic cultures. For example, people in Western cultures choose friends or mates based on attraction, personality, and personal preferences, unlike some collectivistic cultures that arrange marriages between people based on other needs.

Although the incidental, background details within an ad may seem insignificant, "a well-crafted message, presented against a backdrop of props that 'make sense' and reinforce the intended meaning, can convey a powerful and persuasive image...The impact of the best-intentioned message may be eroded if viewers' expectations regarding the appropriate context are violated" (Solomon & Greenberg, 1993, p. 11).

Gaps in Existing Research

The existing research provides a basic understanding of cultural values for advertisers; however, three gaps in knowledge need to be addressed. First, no previous studies have compared cultural values portrayed in the

advertising of France, Spain, and the U.S. Second, while several studies have addressed cultural values, only a few have investigated individualism and/or collectivism (Cheng, 1994; Frith & Wesson, 1991; McCarty & Hattwick, 1992). Third, none have addressed possible variations in the expression of individualism among different individualistic countries, which we believe exist because the expression of collectivism is different among the Japanese, Chinese, and Koreans (Vogel, 1963). Rather than assuming that the value is the same across countries, individualism, like collectivism, may have different variations that represent important differences among cultures. This study addresses the information gaps by investigating countries never before compared on the basis of cultural values, adding to our knowledge of individualism, and examining differences in the way three individualistic countries express the value.

Past research in the field has utilized content analysis effectively; however, a departure from quantitative to qualitative research in the form of document analysis (Denzin 1978) offers an opportunity to gain a different insight. One criticism leveled against content analysis and other techniques traditionally used in cross-cultural research is that the research has imposed American-generated concepts to categorize and characterize other cultures' advertising (The Chinese Culture Connection, 1987). By following a qualitative approach, this study decreases the likelihood of producing results that are "culture

bound" because concepts relevant to each of three cultures can emerge for the analysis.

Three research questions guided the study. The first asks the central question:

RQ1: *Is individualism expressed in the main message strategy of primetime television advertising within three individualistic countries — the U.S., France, and Spain — and if so, how is it expressed?*

The second question asks the strength of these expressions on the basis of frequencies.

RQ2: *How prevalent are these expressions in their respective countries?*

The third question asks the relationship between message strategy and product category. The issue is of interest because advertisers often seek opportunities to use the more efficient, standardized message strategy across countries rather than a specialized approach, which requires separate strategies for each country. If similarities are observed in the message strategy across the three countries by product category, these findings address the standardization/specialization issue. To that end the third research question asks:

RQ3: *What relationship, if any, exists between message strategy and product categories?*

METHODS

Sample Commercials

A total of 211 commercials — 68 French, 62 Spanish, and 81 American — were analyzed for messages of individualism. The French and Spanish commercials were obtained from London International

Advertising Awards (1993). The commercials are not necessarily award-winning. However, since the commercials were submitted by the agencies themselves, they are thought to represent the best creative work of French and Spanish agencies. Commercial length ranged from ten to sixty seconds and the majority of commercials lasted thirty seconds. The 81 American commercials analyzed for this study appeared on the tapes, Best TV Commercials of 1991 (Advertising Age, 1991) and Best TV Commercials of 1992 (Advertising Age, 1992).

Analytical Process

Stage 1 — Code Development. Stages 1 through 3 were developed to address RQ1. Using Hofstede's key differences in collectivistic and individualistic societies displayed in Exhibit 1, an initial set of codes was developed to answer the question "What will happen if I buy and use the product?" Some possible answers were: I can take better care of myself or my family; I will become more "me"; my children will become more independent; I will learn how to learn; I will gain self-respect; I will win a promotion or increase my skill level; I will be better or more efficient at accomplishing my tasks; I will be more attractive; I will be healthier. In addition, informal interviews were conducted among two French and two Spanish natives asking how individualism might be expressed in their culture. (Since the researchers are both natives of the U.S., interviews among Americans were not deemed

necessary.) Responses included, among others, automobile driving habits, speech patterns, choice of reading material, and leisure activities. Viewing a sample of commercials with the informants added the message elements of "I will have a moment of pleasure; I will gain knowledge; I will enjoy life; I will be smarter."

One might ask whether such benefits to the individual are always evidence of individualistic rather than collectivistic behavior; for example, is attractiveness valued in collectivistic cultures? For this study, the decision that these items should be coded as individualistic is based on the lack of stated or implied benefit to a group. While being attractive may not only benefit the individual but the family of the attractive person, no claims were made to that effect; thus, these ads were regarded as examples of individualism. In collectivistic cultures, the advertising may imply that benefits exist for others in addition to the individual, but these claims were not stated in these ads. Similarly, since care of family was limited to nuclear family, the ad was coded as individualistic. If any ads had included care of extended family members, a category for collectivism would have emerged.

Stage 2 — Analysis of Main Messages in Commercials. The next stage required the analysis of each commercial for a dominant message element of individualism. Following the path of analytic induction (Glaser & Strauss, 1967), we asked two questions for each commercial: (1) does the commercial carry a message of indi-

vidualism, and, if so (2) what is the message of individualism. Analytic induction involves viewing the commercials for message elements, developing a working scheme of these elements, then modifying and refining the scheme on the basis of subsequent cases (Goetz & LeCompte, 1984). Commercials that do not fit the initial scheme are sought in order to expand, adapt, or restrict the original set of message elements.

When determining whether a commercial carries a message of individualism, the "main message element" was selected as the unit of analysis. Main message element was defined as the "advertiser's intended overall impression to be gained from viewing the commercial" (Wolburg & Taylor, 1997a, 1997b, 1998). It was deduced by asking hypothetically after viewing the commercial, "What will happen if I buy and use the advertised product." Identifying the main message element is comparable to a stage used in the deconstruction of ads when inferring the "advertiser's intended meaning" or expected meaning that a reader might get from an ad (Frith, 1997; Hall, 1976). When deconstructing ads, researchers look for different levels of meaning: the surface meaning, the advertiser's intended meaning, and the cultural or ideological meaning (Frith, 1997).

Although some commercials contained elements of more than one main message element (e.g., it is possible to gain attractiveness in an efficient manner by using fast-acting products), the main message element that was most prominent was coded

for each ad that contained a message of individualism. After repeated viewings, 15 main message elements were identified:

- (1) Take better care of myself/my family
- (2) Become more "me"
- (3) Gain self-respect
- (4) Learn how to learn
- (5) Make children more independent
- (6) Win a promotion or increase skill level
- (7) Work more efficiently
- (8) Save money
- (9) Become more attractive/healthier
- (10) Gain knowledge
- (11) Improve mental skills
- (12) Have a moment of pleasure
- (13) Have fun/enjoy life
- (14) Become seductive/be seduced /be romantic
- (15) Perform at a certain, though not necessarily optimal, level

Thirty-six commercials comprised a group that were coded as not having messages of individualism since they merely demonstrated how a product worked, its function, or its applications without reference to individuals. For example, a French commercial that personified Bacardi Rum and Coca-Cola in a relationship but showed no people in the ad was coded as having no message of individualism. In all, the study identified 175 commercials of the total 211 that contained messages of individualism.

Stage 3 — Refinement of Main Message Strategies. The set of commercials was viewed again in order to refine the understanding of the mes-

sage elements. The 15 main messages previously developed were analyzed, and some were combined into a single category while others were subsumed under other codes. This step was taken because after working with the 15 categories, it was apparent that some were more concrete than necessary, and a smaller number of categories at a higher level of abstraction would provide a better representation of the data. For example, learning how to learn, winning a promotion, increasing skill level, working efficiently, saving money were all subsumed under the concept of efficiency; likewise, the healthy and attractive codes were merged because the two ideas were almost always intermingled in the ads. In all, six main message strategies were formed.

The two researchers were able to serve as coders, since "qualitative design requires the researcher to become the research instrument" and to observe and analyze the data (Janesick, 1994, p. 212). By working as a team, a consensus was reached; thus, agreement was 100% for identification of the presence/absence of individualism and the type of main message strategy.

Stage Four — Calculating Frequencies of Individualism Messages. To address RQ2, this stage required the computation of the numbers and percentages of total messages of individualism within cultures and the different types of main message strategy across cultures. Chi-square analyses were performed to determine whether differences were significant. While interpretive approaches sel-

dom utilize statistical analysis, qualitative research does not oppose using statistics when the data is appropriate (Taylor, 1994). The philosophy that grounded the study remained qualitative; however, Chi-square analyses were included to aid the interpretation of the numerical data.

Stage Five — Analysis of Message by Product Category According to Culture. To address RQ3 the commercials for each country were assigned to product categories as equitably as possible across cultures, given that not all products are advertised on television within all three cultures.

Since no existing studies could serve as a model, product categories were created on the basis of practicality and logic. In order to avoid having too large a number of separate categories for analysis, six product categories emerged with products within categories linked as closely as possible, e.g., Food & Beverage.

Then the 175 commercials with main messages of individualism were further separated according to message strategy within product categories in order to determine whether certain message strategies are better suited to some products than others. Because 25% of the cells had an entry of zero, this data did not lend itself to valid Chi-square analysis.

RESULTS

RQ1 asked whether individualism is expressed in the main message strategy in the advertising of France, Spain, and the U.S., and if so, how it is expressed. The study found that overall individualism is expressed in 83%

of advertising messages by way of six well-defined message strategies that exist across the three countries: the Efficient Individual, the Sensual Individual, the Attractive/Healthy Individual, the Esteemed Individual, the "Performant(e)" Individual, and the Intellectual Individual. The strategies are explained and examples are provided in the "Discussion and Implications" section.

RQ2 asked how prevalent these expressions are in the respective countries. Table 1 shows the number and percentages of individualism messages within the samples for each

country, and Table 2 shows the number and percentage of each type of main message strategy within each country. Table 1 shows that a large number of messages were individualistic (75% or more for each country's sample), and that a greater percentage of individualism messages were found in the Spanish sample (95%), than the French (82%) and American (75%) samples. Analysis confirmed that the presence of individualism message was significantly related to country. Chi-square (2, $N = 211$) = 8.28, $p < .05$.

Table 1

Percent Composition of Messages of Individualism

Country	# Commercials Analyzed	Number (and %) with message
France	68	56 (82%)
Spain	62	58 (95%)
United States	81	61 (75%)
Total	211	175 (83%)

Chi-square (2, $N = 211$) = 8.28, $p < .05$

Table 2 shows that there is considerable variation in the use of the six different strategies among the three countries. Messages for the Efficient Individual and the Sensual Individual were used the most frequently within the whole sample, but variations occurred within the countries. Efficiency and Sensuality were the strongest message strategies for France and the U.S., but the Attractive/Healthy Individual and the Intellectual Individual prevailed for Spain.

Overall, the categories used the

least frequently were the Intellectual Individual, the Esteemed Individual, and the Performant(e) Individual; however, this pattern also varied by country. The French ads used the Intellectual, Attractive/Healthy, and Esteemed messages the least; Spanish ads used the Esteemed and Performant(e) the least; and the American ads used the Intellectual and Performant(e) the least. Analysis confirmed that the type of individualism message was significantly related to country. Chi-square (10, $N = 175$) = 52.92, $p < .001$.

Table 2
Distribution of Main Messages Of Individualism in Number and Percentage by Country

Country	Type of Individualism					
	Efficient	Sensual	Attractive Healthy	Esteemed	Performant	Intellectual
France	22 (39%)	21 (38%)	1 (2%)	2 (4%)	9 (15%)	1 (02%)
Spain	11 (19%)	10 (17%)	17 (29%)	4 (07%)	4 (07%)	12 (21%)
U.S.	26 (43%)	12 (20%)	7 (11%)	10 (16%)	5 (08%)	1 (02%)
Total	59 (34%)	43 (25%)	25 (14%)	16 (9%)	18 (10%)	14 (08%)

Chi-square (10, N = 175) = 52.92, p < .001

RQ3 asked what relationship, if any, exists between message strategy and product categories. Table 3 shows that all commercials were classified into six product categories: food/beverage (28%), business/financial/media (21%), household (09%), personal care (11%), automobile/transportation (10%), and other (20%). Examples of products classified as "other" included a lottery, a public relief agency, and department stores. Further divisions within product category were made according to type of individualism message in order to assess that relationship (see Table 4). Although Chi-square analysis could not be performed, some observable trends are reported that offer suggestions for advertisers attempting to

standardize messages. Food/beverage and personal care products in this sample were more frequently presented with sensuality claims while business/media/financial products, household goods, and automobile/transportation products were more frequently presented with efficiency claims. Future research will be able to show whether these patterns emerge in other data sets.

DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

Observation 1: Advertising promotes the value of individualism across cultures. Surprisingly, the rank order of individualism in Table 1 is exactly the opposite of Hofstede's finding regarding the level of individ-

Table 3
Product Category Composition Across Three Cultures
In Number and Percentages

Product Category	Total Sample	Culture		
		French	Spanish	American
Food/Beverages	49 (28%)	19 (34%)	15 (26%)	15 (25%)
Business/Media/Financial	37 (21%)	10 (18%)	13 (22%)	14 (23%)
Household	17 (10%)	8 (14%)	7 (12%)	2 (03%)
Personal Care	20 (11%)	10 (17%)	7 (12%)	3 (05%)
Automotive/Transportation	7 (10%)	6 (11%)	4 (07%)	7 (12%)
Other	35 (20%)	3 (05%)	12 (21%)	20 (32%)

Table 4
Main Message of Individualism Across Product Category In Percentages (N=175)

Product Category	Type of Individualism					
	Efficient	Sensual	Attractive/ Healthy	Esteemed	Performant(e)	Intellectual
Food/ Beverages	7 (14%)*	27 (55%)	10 (20%)	2 (4%)	3 (6%)	0 (0%)
Bus/Media/ Financial	26 (70%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (3%)	5 (16%)	4 (11%)
Household	12 (71%)	1 (6%)	1 (6%)	2 (12%)	1 (6%)	0 (0%)
Personal Care	4 (20%) 9 (45%)	7 (35%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	
Automotive/ Transportation	8 (47%)	5 (29%)	0 (0%)	2 (12%)	2 (12%)	0 (0%)
Other	9 (26%)	3 (9%)	5 (14%)	5 (14%)	10 (29%)	3 (9%)

* Row Percent within Product Category

ualism in each country. That is, Spanish television advertising carried a higher percentage of messages of individualism than either France or the United States. This study suggests that French and American advertising are more similar than Spanish advertising, which is surprising considering that France and Spain are both high context cultures and lower in individualism than the United States. The unexpected ranking may be due to the sample studied or could suggest that advertising as a cultural phenomenon is somehow different from other institutions that reflect individualism. Another characteristic of advertising, which is suggested by this study, is that it does not reflect fully all the facets of individualism in a given culture. Some types of individualism such as automobile driving habits may not lend themselves to main message strategies. On the other hand, certain types of individualism such as The Religious Individual or The Thrifty Individual may not

appear in advertising because they do not encourage product purchase.

Observation 2. Across the three cultures advertising uses six main messages of individualism: The Efficient Individual, the Sensual Individual, the Attractive Individual, the Esteemed Individual, the Performant(e) Individual, and the Intellectual Individual. The type of individualism varies considerably across cultures (Table 2). In this section, we describe the six categories, give examples of ads, and show how these message strategies operate within the different countries.

The Efficient Individual. The Efficient Individual is the most prevalent message strategy in the total sample with both the American and French ads containing more efficiency claims than others. The Efficient Individual is made up of the message elements of "children more independent," "learn how to learn," "win a promotion or increase skill level," "save money," and "become more

efficient." In an individualist society, tasks and task completion prevail over relationships. Certain products promise to make people more efficient in their work and household tasks, or to "save" time or money. Forty-three percent of the American messages of individualism were directed to being efficient and 39 percent of the French messages of individualism were so directed. Only 19 percent of the Spanish messages of individualism were directed to efficiency.

In an American commercial for Nissan Altima, a man stacks 10 wine glasses in a pyramid on the car's hood. The car is started and the speedometer reaches 100 mph. Two voice-overs explain that while the viewer may have seen a demonstration like this one for a luxury car, this demonstration is for a \$13,000 car. The commercial concludes with "It's time to expect more from a car."

A French commercial for Alfapac garbage bags combines efficiency with humor. We see an elegantly-dressed woman in a black evening dress and elbow-length black gloves. She closes the ties on the garbage bag as a female voice-over notes that the Alfapac new line of plastic bags with sliding straps is so resistant, so light, and so practical that everyone will want to snatch it. She walks down steps outside her house to the sidewalk and two men on a motorcycle race by and snatch the bag from her hands. She half-heartedly yells, "Thief!" as the two ride away. The two thieves open the bag only to discover trash and toss it upon a pile of

other Alfapac bags, supposedly also filled with garbage. The voice-over tells us that the new bag is "more bag" than "trash."

A Spanish commercial takes advantage of stereotypes about crime and individuality in the United States to show three people being photographed front and side at a police station. The voice-over says, "Salvatore Borcellino robbed 36 banks in 14 states. Little Jack O'Brien hit the Pittsburgh mail train nine times. Mildred Peterson made off with three pizzas, only paid for two of them. But now anybody can get three pizzas and only pay for two, and it's legal." Three pizzas on a table comprise the ending shot.

The comparatively high percentage of efficiency messages directed to American and French consumers seems to indicate that advertisers in these two cultures operate with a view of individualism that is different from the view of Spanish advertisers.

The Sensual Individual. The Sensual Individual is made up of the message elements of "have a moment of pleasure," "have fun/enjoy life," and "become seductive/romantic." Sensuality plays a bigger role in French advertising (38%) than it does in either Spanish (17%) or American advertising (20%); however, it is appreciably present in all three cultures.

A French commercial for St. Yorre mineral water shows individuals engaged in a variety of physical activities such as running, playing tennis, and cycling. A voice-over tells us that the mineral water craves for us, it

thirsts for our strength, our energy, and our taste. While other ads for the same product might logically use an attractive/healthy claim because the product itself can offer healthiness as a benefit, this particular ad used a stronger sensual claim than health claim with its seductive use of craving and its reference to thirst and taste.

An American commercial for Blossom Hill wine demonstrates through a series of visuals and tongue-in-cheek voiceovers that wine is preferable to flowers as a gift for men to give women. At the commercial's closing, wine is poured, a woman caresses her cheek with glass of wine and thinks of the man who gave her the wine.

A Spanish commercial for Limon Kas soft drinks shows an attractive, young man and woman on a stage as they sing "The night is young...young with Limon Kas...with Limon Kas, young is the night." Viewers see a series of night scenes including bright city lights, people dancing, and other people out on the street. The overall impression is the pleasure within the sophisticated night life of the city.

Sensuality and romanticism are integral parts of French culture and are often grouped under the advertising strategy of *la séduction*, (Taylor, Hoy, & Haley, 1996), which translates as "enticing, charming, alluring." It represents the idea that products can seduce consumers. In American and Spanish advertising, sensuality is more commonly expressed along the lines of "moment of pleasurable taste" or "having fun."

The Attractive/Healthy Individual.

The Attractive/Healthy Individual is made up of the messages of elements of "become more attractive" and "become healthier." This was the most often used strategy in the sample of Spanish commercials. Spanish advertisers' appeals to the Attractive/Healthy Individual accounted for 29 percent of the messages of individualism. In the United States, appeals to the Attractive/Healthy Individual accounted for 11 percent of the messages while in France such appeals accounted for only 2 percent of the messages.

In a Spanish commercial for Carbonel Virgin Olive Oil, a male voice-over speaks to the viewer while images of the Virgin Mary appear on screen:

The blessed virgin of perpetual help sheltered us from the winds. The blessed virgin of the sorrows brought us rain. The blessed virgin of hope kept the frost away. The blessed virgin of the rosary watched over the harvest. The blessed virgin of the wayside protected the farmers. Carbonel Virgin Olive Oil protects your health.

A French commercial for Lactel milk is set around the breakfast table with father, mother, a son, and two daughters. As the children reject their father's explanation that boys are born in cabbage patches and girls in rose gardens, a voice-over tells us that because Lactel milk contains vitamins it is ideal for growth and development. Similarly, in an American commercial for Verilux bifocals the branded no-line bifocals are presented as

the "perfect disguise" for "those who refuse to be seen in bifocals."

The Esteemed Individual. The Esteemed Individual is one who feels better about himself/herself psychologically or emotionally because of the use of certain products. The Esteemed Individual strategy is made up of the elements of "become more me" and "gain self-respect." This message of individualism accounted for 16 percent of American messages of individualism, 7 percent of Spanish messages, and 4 percent of French messages.

An American McDonald's commercial titled "Perfect Season," features scenes of elementary school-age children participating in football games. Their fathers are coaches and two fathers form a goal post. The commercial includes this voiceover: "So McDonald's would like to salute the players, the coaches, and the families who helped to make this season the perfect season." A player asks: "Can we go to McDonald's now, Coach?" The coach humorously replies, "After the game, Lenny. It's only half time. Go sit down."

In a French commercial for Scottex bathroom tissue, a young boy is riding his bicycle in the country when he discovers an abandoned baby bird. He takes the bird home and creates a nest of tissue in a shoebox. The tagline tells the viewer the product is "soft like you."

In a Spanish commercial for Red Cross volunteers, a crowd of people is walking away from the viewers so that we see only their backs. A voiceover asks, "How many people have it

in them to help others without receiving something in return?" As one man turns as though volunteering, the following words are superimposed on the screen: "Red Cross Volunteers. 3006565. Call Us." Self-esteem through product purchase and use is not a heavily used appeal in any of the three cultures. However, it is associated much more with American advertising than with either French or Spanish advertising.

The Performant(e) Individual. The Performant(e) Individual emerged from the French sample although it exists in the samples for the other countries. It is best aligned with French culture; thus, the language chosen for the term is French rather than English or Spanish. The performant(e) message strategy is made up of the message elements of "it works" or "it works well." The efficiency message of "it works better than something else" or "it works quicker" is not a part of this message strategy. This strategy eschews comparisons that might be made in the messages of individual efficiency and reflects the self-effacing characteristics of individuals. It differs from the Esteemed Individual strategy in that the individual does not feel better for having something that works or performs. The message elements and the strategy category came from suggestions made by our French and Spanish native informants about how individualism is expressed in those cultures. This strategy accounts for 15 percent of French messages of individualism, 8 percent of American messages, and 7 percent of Spanish

commercials.

In a French commercial for Stihl chainsaws, we see a man on vacation in a beach house. The view out his window is partially blocked by an overhanging tree limb. He walks off-screen and we hear the sound of a chain saw starting and running. The man returns to sit in his chair. An exterior shot shows us his beach house is elevated by stilts and we see his house fall to the beach level, giving him an unobstructed view of the ocean. The ad plays off the surprise that he has sawed the stilts that support his house instead of the overhanging tree limb; however, the overall impression we gain is that the product works for whatever need we may have. There is neither a claim that the Stihl saw is the best tool for the job, nor a claim of savings of time, effort, or money; thus, the claim is not one of efficiency.

In a Spanish commercial for Iber Caja bank a young literature teacher, dressed in black leather jacket and short skirt, waits for someone in the street. She dismisses a man who tries to pick her up. Another man, whom she is presumably waiting for, comes by and they walk together. The voice-over tells us, "At Iber Caja we know that with time you can attain everything you aim for. That's why we help you from the very beginning. Iber Caja. Your future is also our future." This ad lacks any claims of better use of money, better services, higher interest rates, etc., that would have made the claim one of efficiency instead of mere performance. The claim may also deliver a subtle esteem message (you can attain everything you aim

for), but the bank's ability to perform appears to be stronger than its ability to deliver self-esteem; thus, the performant(e) coding is used.

In an American commercial for American National Bank, visuals show a man who owns a business of selling buttons. He tells the viewer how important his business is for paying for his and his workers' food, clothes, houses, and their children's education. A voice-over asks, "It's your life's work. Does your bank understand that?" Similar to the Spanish ad for Iber Caja Bank, this commercial claims the bank will perform by understanding the importance of the client's business. No claims of efficiency are made, and no explicit comparisons are made with other banks.

This appeal to individualism would appear to run counter to classic American advertising strategies offered by advertising giants, such as the unique selling proposition as practiced by Rosser Reeves, preemption as advocated by Claude Hopkins, and brand personality and differentiation as suggested by David Ogilvy. Its use indicates that individuals can be modest and self-effacing, even in highly individualistic cultures.

The Intellectual Individual. The Intellectual Individual is made up of the message elements of "gain knowledge" and "improve mental skills." It accounts for 21 percent of Spanish messages of individualism but only 2 percent of American messages and 2 percent of French messages.

A Spanish commercial for a fairy

tale book associates the Big Bad Wolf with Saddam Hussein, the Little Toy Soldier with Gen. Norman Schwarzkopf, the Happy Prince with Prince Charles, and Little Red Riding Hood with Margaret Thatcher. A voice-over asks, "If these are the tales your children are dreaming about, aren't they missing something very important. Let them discover the Universal Tales of Orbis — the real tales."

A French commercial uses a futuristic urban setting for a Sega video game. A villainous man bypasses building security to enter into a video game. He becomes part of the game and is destroyed. We learn that he is really a robot. The closing line challenges us to play the game that has a "stronger mind than we do." Similarly, an American commercial for Time magazine promotes an issue of the magazine that features a cover story on abortion. The final voice-over states, "Why Roe versus Wade is moot. If it's important to you, you'll find it in Time."

To an extent the variation in findings for this category is probably more a reflection of regulation and media choices than they are true expressions of differences in individualism in the three cultures. For example, the French are among the most prolific book buyers and readers in the world (Hall and Hall 1990); however, because French media regulations prevent books from being advertised on television, the French messages directed to the Intellectual Individual are to be found in media other than television.

Observation 3: Messages of individualism reflect cultural patterns more so than they do product categories. As noted earlier, commercials were classified into six product categories, and an attempt was made to aggregate products into comparable categories across cultures; however, it should be noted that regulation does affect the analysis. For example, of the 45 commercials classified in the business/financial/media category, 12 are French, 19 are American, and 14 are Spanish. However, France does not permit the advertising of books or movies on television whereas Spanish and American television systems do. Four of the Spanish commercials in this category were for media products that could not be advertised on television in France. The products advertised in this study appear to be representative of those typically advertised in the respective countries since the product category composition of French commercials in the present study is comparable to what Zandpour, Chang & Catalano (1992) reported for broadcast advertising in France, and the composition of American commercials in the present study is comparable to those reported by the top 25 network television advertisers (Television Bureau of Advertising, 1994).

When messages of individualism are cross-tabulated with product category without regard to culture (Table 4), several relationships emerge. As noted previously, the food and beverage category and personal care products most often use appeals to the Sensual Individual although personal

care goods can also appeal strongly to the Attractive/Healthy Individual. Household goods, business/media/financial products, and automobiles/transportation appeal most often to the Efficient Individual. However, only two of these patterns are true for all three cultures individually: (1) messages of efficiency dominate the household products category in all three cultures, and (2) food and beverage commercials are designed to appeal to individual sensuality. One pattern holds true for two of the three cultures: in both the United States and France, appeals to The Efficient Individual are most often associated with business and financial institutions. Beyond these three patterns, there is considerable variation.

CONCLUSIONS

Contributions of this Study

This study contributes to the body of knowledge about advertising and cultural values in several ways. In particular it offers an alternate methodology, provides insight into the multiple expressions of individualism, and addresses issues of standardization and specialization. Limitations and suggested avenues for future research are discussed.

Method. This study demonstrates an alternative to standard content analyses for examining advertising and drawing comparisons across cultures. Instead of using existing categories that might have been sufficient for one culture but insufficient for another, a method was chosen to maximize the variations among cul-

tures.

Message Strategy and Individualism. The question of whether or not individualism varies across cultures is new to advertising research. This study demonstrates that individualism is a complex cultural value that can be expressed in a variety of ways depending upon what specific elements are valued within a culture. Findings show that the most certain way for Americans to achieve individualism is by being efficient; for the French, efficiency and sensuality are almost equally strong paths; and the Spanish find the most certain path through attractiveness/healthiness.

Advertisers previously treated individualism as one value. This study suggests that in order to create messages that resonate with consumers, advertisers must not only determine the presence/absence of individualism within a given country, but also to find out what paths exist for its expression and which are the strongest.

Issues of Standardization/ Specialization. The issue of whether to adopt a standardized product line and a standardized communications program for all cultures or to adopt individual strategies for each culture is a basic decision every management team must make within the multinational corporation. Generally, those managers who advocate a standardized approach believe that people of diverse cultures share basic needs and motivations that can be reached universally through a single approach. Standardized strategies also offer unity of brand image and economy of

advertising development. On the other hand, some managers argue that even if products are not culturally-bound, the advertising for such products typically is.

Ironically, advice from the academic research community is often contradictory to that of management. For example, some researchers have suggested that food and fashion products will best lend themselves to standardized approaches (Domzal & Kernan, 1993); other researchers have suggested that food is the product least amenable to standardization (Moriarty & Duncan, 1990), while still others have suggested that the difference may lie between durables and nondurables (Cutler & Javalgi, 1992). To add even more fuel to the fire, this study suggests that at least for French, Spanish and American cultures household goods and food and beverages would be most amenable to a standardized approach. However, the more important finding is that culture supersedes product category.

Limitations

The results of this study are based on samples drawn from exemplars of television advertising in French, Spanish, and American cultures. Exemplars are appropriate for a study whose purpose is to identify and develop cultural categories (Stake, 1994). Even though the product category compositions for the French commercials and the American commercials are comparable to other known and studied samples, this does not necessarily mean that in these societies the main message

strategies would appear in the same distribution patterns reported here. This study uses only television commercials; if other media had been included, then additional message strategies might have been identified. As noted, given the restrictions placed on advertising in various cultures, a sampling of advertisements from all available media is necessary to develop a complete typology of individualism in a particular culture. By studying what appears in advertising, this study makes no claim about how individualism manifests itself in other institutions within culture. Those types of individualism may be slightly different from the kinds reported here.

A further limitation is that when analyzing product category by individualism message, a 36 cell matrix results. This requires a large sample size to have adequate entries for all cells. A larger data set would overcome this difficulty.

Future Research

This study demonstrates that six types of individualism are sufficient for analyzing messages of individualism in the three cultures under study. Future research in this area could begin with the identified six types of individualism and inductively extend this analysis to other cultures. For example, it would be helpful to know how many additional main messages of individualism would be needed if other countries high in individualism such as Australia, Great Britain, Canada, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Italy, Belgium, Denmark,

Sweden, Ireland, Switzerland, Germany, South Africa, and Norway, were added to the study. Similarly, adding additional media categories to the existing study would be helpful. In contrast, the examination and analysis of the dominant values intertwined with advertising in countries with low levels of individualism such as Venezuela, Colombia, Pakistan, Peru, and Taiwan would help to illuminate even more the results reported here.

Another extension of this research would add contextual analysis. Contextual cues such as gender, race, ethnic group, age, occupation, portrayal of nuclear family, and camera techniques, which also carry messages of individualism, may be as important as main message strategy. In fact, contextual cues may be the key to understanding different advertising executions in high and low context cultures.

REFERENCES

- Aceves, J. B. (1971). *Social change in a Spanish village*. Cambridge, MS: Schenkman Publishing Company.
- Advertising Age. (1991). *The best TV commercials of 1991*. Chicago: Crain Communications.
- Advertising Age. (1992). *The best TV commercials of 1992*. Chicago: Crain Communications.
- Advertising Age. (1996). *Advertising's top 100*. (September 30), 54.
- Aries, P. (1981). *The hour of our death*. (H. Weaver, Trans.). New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Baumeister, R. F. (1987). How the self became a problem: A psychological review of historical research. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 52 (1), 163-176.
- Bellah, R. N., Madsen, R., Sullivan, W. M., Swidler, A., & Tipton, S. M. (1985). *Habits of the heart: Individualism and commitment in American life*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Belk, R. W. & Bryce, W. J. (1986). Materialism and individual determinism in U.S. and Japanese print and television advertising. In R. J. Lutz (Ed.) *Advances in Consumer Research — Vol. 13*. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Belk, R. W., & Pollay, R. W. (1985a). Images of ourselves: The good life in twentieth century advertising. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 11: 887-897.
- Belk, R.W., & Pollay, R. W. (1985b). Materialism and magazine advertising during the twentieth century. In E. C. Hirschman & M. B. Holbrook (Eds.) *Advances in Consumer Research, Vol. 12*. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.

- Beik, R. W. & Pollay, R. W. (1985c). Materialism and status appeals in Japanese and U.S. print advertising. *International Marketing Review*, Winter, 38-47.
- Cheng, H. (1994). Reflections of cultural values: A content analysis of Chinese magazine advertisements from 1982 and 1992. *International Journal of Advertising*, 13, 167-183.
- Cook, P. (1985). *The cinema book*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Cutler, B. D. & Javagli, R. (1992). A Cross-cultural analysis of the visual components of print advertising. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 32 (1), 71-80.
- Denzin, N. K. (1978). *The research act: A theoretical introduction to sociological methods*. 2nd edition. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Domzal, T. J., & Kernan, J. B. (1993). Mirror, mirror: some postmodern reflections on global advertising. *Journal of Advertising*, 22, 1-20.
- Frith, K. T. (1997). Undressing the ad: reading culture in advertising. In K. T. Frith (Ed.) *Undressing the ad: reading culture in advertising*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Frith, K. T., & Wesson, D. (1991). A comparison of cultural values in British and American print advertising: A study of magazines. *Journalism Quarterly*, 68 (1/2) Spring/Summer, 216-223.
- Glaser, B. & Strauss, A. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory*. Chicago: Aldine.
- Goetz, J., & LeCompte, M. (1984). *Ethnography and qualitative designs in educational research*. San Diego: Academic Press.
- Gross, B. L., & Sheth, J. N. (1989). Time-oriented advertising: A content analysis of United States magazine advertising, 1890-1988. *Journal of Marketing*, 53, 76-83.
- Hall, E. T. (1959). *The silent language*. New York: Doubleday.
- Hall, E. T. (1976). *Beyond culture*. New York: Doubleday.
- Hall, E. T. & Hall, M. R. (1990). *Understanding cultural differences*. Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural.
- Hofstede, G. (1980). *Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values*. Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Hofstede, G. (1991). *Cultures and organizations: Software of the mind*. London: McGraw Hill Book Company.
- Holbrook, M. B. (1987). Mirror, mirror, on the wall, what's unfair in the reflections on advertising?" *Journal of Marketing*, 51, 95-103.

- Janseick, V. J. (1994). The dance of qualitative research design: Metaphor, methodolatry, and meaning. In N. K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Kluckhohn, C. (1951). Values and value orientations in the theory of action. In T. Parsons & E. A. Shils (Eds.) *Toward a General Theory of Action*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Kluckhohn, F. R., & Strodtbeck, F. L. (1961). *Variations in value orientations*. Evanston, IL: Row, Peterson and Company.
- Leo Burnett Company. (1994). *Worldwide advertising and media fact book*. Chicago: Triumph Books.
- Lodge, G. C. (1975). *The new American ideology*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- London International Advertising Awards. (1993). *Advertising by Country — France*. New York.
- London International Advertising Awards. (1993). *Advertising by Country — Spain*. New York.
- MacIntyre, A. (1981). *After virtue*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Mandese, J. (1993). Home improvement' wins \$ race. *Advertising Age*, September 6 (3, 26).
- Maslow, A. H. (1970). *Motivation and personality*, 2nd edition. New York: Harper & Row.
- Mariscal, G. (1991). *Contradictory subjects: Quevedo, Cervantes, and seventeenth century Spanish culture*. New York: Cornell University Press.
- McCarty, J. A. & Hattwick, P. M. (1992). Cultural value orientations: A comparison of magazine advertisements from the United States and Mexico. In J. F. Sherry, Jr. & B. Sternthal (Eds.) *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 19. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Miller, D. L. (1967). *Individualism: Personal achievement and the open society*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Moriarty, S. E. (1991). *Creative advertising theory and practice*, 2nd. Edition. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Moriarty, S. E., & Duncan, T. R. (1990). Global advertising: Issues and practices. *Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 13, 313-341.
- Mueller, B. (1987). Reflections of culture: An analysis of Japanese and American advertising appeals. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 4 (June/July): 51-59.
- Nelson, R. P. (1989). *The design of advertising*. Dubuque, IA: William C. Brown.

- Nisbet, R. (1973). *The social philosophers: Community and conflict in western thought*. New York: Crowell.
- Ogilvy, D. (1985). *Ogilvy on advertising*. New York: Vintage Books.
- O'Sullivan, T., Hartley, J., Saunders, D., Montgomery, M., & Fiske, J. (1994). *Key concepts in communication and cultural studies*. London: Routledge.
- Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring the cultural values manifest in advertising. *Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 1, 71-92.
- Pollay, R. W. (1984). The identification and distribution of values manifest in print advertising 1900-1980. In R. E. Pitts, Jr. & Arch G. Woodside (Eds.) *Personal Values and Consumer Psychology*. Lexington, MA: D. C. Heath and Company.
- Pollay, R. W. (1986). The distorted mirror: Reflections on the unintended consequences of advertising. *Journal of Marketing*, 50, 18-36.
- Pollay, R. W. & Gallagher, K. (1990). Advertising and cultural values: Reflections in the distorted mirror. *International Journal of Advertising*, 9 (4): 359-372.
- Russell, J. T., & Lane, W. R. (1993). *Kleppner's advertising procedure*, 12th Edition. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Seidman, M. (1996). Individualisms in Madrid during the Spanish Civil War. *Journal of Modern History*, 68 (1), 63-83.
- Solomon, M. R., & Greenberg L. (1993). Setting the stage: Collective selection in the stylistic context of the commercials. *Journal of Advertising*, 22 (1), 11-23.
- Stake, R. E. (1994). Case studies. In N. K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Strauss, A. & J. Corbin (1994). Grounded theory methodology: An overview. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Tansey, R. M., Hyman, R. & Zinkhan, G. M. (1990). Cultural themes in Brazilian and U.S. auto ads: A cross-cultural comparison. *Journal of Advertising*, 19 (2), 40-48.
- Taylor, R. E. (1994). Qualitative Research. In M. W. Singletary (Ed.) *Mass Communication Research*. New York: Longman.
- Taylor, R. E., Hoy, M., & Haley, E. (1996). How French advertising professionals develop creative strategy. *Journal of Advertising*, 25 (1), 1-14.
- Television Bureau of Advertising. (1994). Personal correspondence with the company.

- The Chinese Culture Connection (a team of 24 researchers led by M. F. Bond) (1987). Chinese values and the search for culture-free dimensions of culture. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 18 (2), 143-164.
- Triandis, H. C. (1985). Collectivism vs. individualism: A reconceptualization of a basic concept in cross-cultural psychology. In C. Gabley and G. K. Verma (Eds.) *Personality, cognition and values: Cross-cultural perspectives of childhood and adolescence*. London: Macmillan, 57-89.
- Triandis, H. C. (1989). The self and social behavior in differing cultural contexts. *Psychological Review*, 96 (3), 506-520.
- Trompenaars, F. (1993). *Ride the waves of culture*. Boston: The Economist Books.
- United States Declaration of Independence (1776).
- Vogel, E. F. (1963). *Japan's new middle class*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Wiles, C. R., Wiles, J. A. & Tjernlund, A. (1996). The ideology of advertising: The United States and Sweden. *Journal of Advertising Research*, May/June: 57-66.
- Wolburg, J. M. & Taylor, R. E. (1997a). An investigation of three cultural values in American advertising: The role of the individual, the depiction of time, and the configuration of space. Presented at the national conference of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication. Chicago.
- Wolburg, J. M. & Taylor, R. E. (1997b). Rethinking the unintended consequences: The pursuit of individualism in primetime television advertising. Presented at the national conference of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication. Chicago.
- Wolburg, J. M. & Taylor, R. E. (1998). Celebrate the moments of your life: An investigation of time as a cultural value in American television advertising. In J.B. Ford and E.D. Honeycutt, Jr. (Eds.) *Developments in Marketing Science, Vol. XXI*. Norfolk, Va: Academy of Marketing Science, 363-367.
- Zandpour, F., Chang, C. & Catalano, J. (1992). Stories, symbols, and straight talk: A comparative analysis of French, Taiwanese, and U.S. TV commercials. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 32 (1), 25-38.
- Zinkhan, G. M., Hong, J. W., & Lawson, L. (1990). Achievement and affiliation motivation. *Journal of Business Research*, 20, 135-144.
- Zinkhan, G. M., & Shermohamad, A. (1986). Is other-directedness on the increase? An empirical test of Riesman's theory of social character. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 13, 127-130.

APPENDIX

Summary of Hofstede's Characteristics of Individualistic Cultures Family Life

Family Life

1. Children grow up in nuclear families
2. People look after themselves and their immediate family; children break with parents or keep relationships to a minimum at adulthood
3. Children learn to spend time alone, unlike collectivist children who are almost never alone
4. Speaking one's mind is a virtue and is characteristic of a sincere and honest person
5. Independent thinking and confrontation lead to higher truth
6. Children are expected and encouraged to develop opinions of their own, and children who never voice opinions are thought to have a weak character
7. Children are encouraged to take small jobs in order to earn pocket-money of their own, which they alone can decide how to spend
8. Financial and ritual obligations to the family are less compulsory than in collectivist cultures
9. Conversations are compulsory; silence is considered abnormal.
10. Communication is more often explicit (low context communication)
11. Self-respect (defined from the point of view of the individual—not the social environment) is the closest counterpart to the collectivistic concept of face; likewise, guilt vs. shame

Education

1. Children are encouraged to speak up in class and express their own opinion without consulting the group or working in groups
2. Students expect to be treated impartially by teachers
3. Students from different ethnic groups are not bound to an ingroup and mix more freely
4. Students form groups on an ad hoc basis according to the task or to particular friendships and skills
5. Teachers who favored students of the same ethnic background would be considered guilty of nepotism and immoral behavior, while those in a collectivistic environment would be required to give special treatment to ingroup members
6. Confrontations and open discussions of conflicts are highly regarded even at the expense of harmony
7. The purpose of education is to teach people to learn to cope with new, unforeseen situations that will arise through life rather than looking upon learning as a one-time process for the young
8. Diplomas improve the holder's economic worth but also his or her self-respect because it provides a sense of achievement
9. Individual self-respect is more important than the social acceptance that diplomas can provide

Work

1. The worker's self-interest and employer's interest should coincide
2. Workers are individuals with their own combination of economic and psychological needs
3. Working relationships with family members are considered undesirable because they may lead to nepotism or conflict of interest.
4. Poor performance of the employee or a better pay offer from another employer are legitimate and socially accepted reasons for terminating a work relationship.
5. Management skills require management of individuals rather than groups
6. Bonuses are given to individuals rather than to groups
7. Appraisal of performance is communicated directly rather than by indirect, face-saving tactics
8. Universalism (treating everybody alike) is valued over particularism (treating one's friends better than others)
9. Tasks prevail over personal relationships
10. Important goals on the job are having enough personal time for family, having the freedom to adopt own's own approach to the job, and having challenging work to do

Ideas and Philosophy

1. Individual interests prevail over collective interests
2. Everyone has a right to privacy and is expected to have a private opinion
3. Laws and rights are supposed to be the same for all
4. Individualistic cultures usually have higher per capita GNP's than collective cultures
5. A restrained role of the state rather than a dominant role prevails in the economic system
6. The economy is based on individual rather than collective interests
7. Political power is exercised by voters instead of interest groups
8. Native rather than imported economic theories prevail and are based on pursuit of individual self-interests
9. Freedom of press exists rather than state control of press
10. Ideologies of individual freedom prevail over ideologies of equality
11. Self-actualization (realizing the creative potential within the individual to the fullest) is the ultimate goal for every individual