

Marquette University

e-Publications@Marquette

Philosophy Faculty Research and Publications


Philosophy, Department of

10-2019

Introduction: Cities as Ways of World Making

Curtis Carter

Follow this and additional works at: https://epublications.marquette.edu/phil_fac

 Part of the [Philosophy Commons](#)

Introduction : Cities as Ways of World Making

The theme of “Ways of World Making” appears in the writings of philosophers such as Ernst Cassirer and Nelson Goodman (1906-1998). Cassirer takes up this theme in *Language and Myth* (Tr. by Susan Langer (Harper, 1946), and Goodman addresses “The Ways of World Making” in his book bearing this title (Hackett, 1978, 1981). Both philosophers cite the arts as key ways of world making in their function as various forms of symbols.

For Cassirer, art as a form of world making originates in imagination and gives us “the intuition of the form of thingsas a true and genuine discovery.” (Cassirer, *Philosophy of Symbolic Forms*) Art offers a perspective that differs from ordinary seeing as well as from the impoverished abstractions of science based on facts or purported natural laws.

In his book *Ways of Worldmaking* Goodman examines the formative functions of symbols. Goodman asks probing questions concerning our uses of language/literature, pictures, and other types of symbols to create worlds of understanding. For example, he asks, “In just what sense are there many worlds? What distinguishes genuine from spurious worlds? How are they made? ...And how is worldmaking related to knowing?”¹ Goodman holds that “the arts must be taken no less seriously than the sciences as modes of discovery, creation, and enlargement of knowledge” in their role of advancement of understanding.²

¹ Nelson Goodman, *Ways of Worldmaking* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1978), p. 1.

² *Ibid.*, p. 102.

Following the insights of Cassirer and Goodman, “ways of worldmaking” is explored here first in reference to the imaginative world making roles of works of the arts that relate to cities. Works of art including the literary works of JRR Tolkien, the opera “Mahagony” a musical composition by Kurt Weill and Berthold Brecht, Xu Bing’s recent film “Dragon Fly Eyes” (1917), and “Hudson Yards” the current city development which opened officially in New York city (2019), will be offered as instances of worldmaking with respect to the arts and city development.

Hence, the aim of this essay is to explore various manifestations of “world making” in a selection of arts relating to world making of fictive cities in the arts and then in reference to the formation of contemporary cities themselves as ways of world making as this process is revealed in the New York project known as “Hudson Yards.”

I. Tolkien and Ways of World Making

My interest in World Making in reference to Tolkien began with an exhibition at the Haggerty Museum which carried the title “The Invented Worlds of J. R. R. Tolkien”.³ As it happens recent scholarship on Tolkien appears to be notably focused on the theme of world making. Among recent publications on Tolkien’s works is the 2019 publication *Sub-creating Arda: World Building in J. R. R. Tolkien’s World, its Precursors, and Legacies*, edited by Fimi and Honegger.⁴ Among the insights in these texts especially relevant to our topic here is Andrew Higgins’ account of Tolkien’s literary and graphic means used in building of his world of *Arda* which includes *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings*. These means include the use of maps, charts, genealogies, and both lexicons and grammars of invented languages. Such literary and graphic means are used both to construct the worlds and to generate the interaction and transaction between author and reader.⁵

³ Curtis L. Carter, “Ways of Worldmaking: J. R. R. Tolkien,” *The Invented Worlds of J. R. R. Tolkien: Drawings and Original Manuscripts from the Marquette University Collection*, October 21, 2004-January 2005, pp. 7-16.

⁴ Dimitri Fimi and Thomas Honegger (editors), *Sub-creating Arda: World-Building in J. R. R. Tolkien’s Works, its Precursors, and Legacies* (Walking Trees Publishers: Zurich and Berne, Switzerland, 2019). According to the Editors Tolkien preferred to address his literary world building as ‘subcreation.’ Current interest in this topic is also reflected in a call for papers focused on Tolkien and the Classical World which notes, “Scholarship on J. R. R. Tolkien has become more and more interested in the topic of worldbuilding...”

⁵ Andrew Higgins, “More than Narrative: The Role of Paratexts in the World-Building of Austin Tappan Wright, J. R. R. Tolkien, and Ursula K. Le Guin,” in Fimi and Honegger (editors), Abstract.

The Hobbit which appeared in 1937 and *The Lord of the Rings* first published in three volumes in 1954-55 both suggest immediately the theme of worldmaking. It is not the worldmaking of statesmen that occupies Tolkien. Rather it is worldmaking made possible through the author's imaginative constructions using words. Tolkien's literary texts cannot be fully appreciated apart from a larger, philosophical issue concerning language. His childhood fascination with inventing languages eventually led him to the study of languages. For Tolkien, a language is a wholly invented enterprise constructed by a mind, or set of minds, and has no natural existence apart from its invention and use by a human mind, or a community of such minds.

* For our purposes here, the question posed is in what sense might Tolkiens's literary and visual images contribute to the theme of world making in general and perhaps also to city as a world making form? The intent here is not to make a full-blown claim or to overstate this possibility but to use Tolkien's ventures into world making as a start for this discussion in the several media proposed here. *

At the core of his invented worlds is the assumption that "language creates the reality it describes."⁶ In this respect, Tolkien holds similar views to those of Goodman who views languages as entirely constructed symbol systems. Like Goodman, Tolkien did not limit his sense of languages to written texts. Fewer people are aware that Tolkien was a talented visual artist not having had the opportunity to view his original drawings and watercolor paintings. These works are known primarily as the illustrations for *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* and other of his texts.⁷ The illustrations offer further insight into the imagined cities of Tolkien.

Just as it is possible for human minds to construct scientific and every day practical worlds, it is equally feasible for them to invent fantasy or secondary worlds with their own systems of logic and alternative structures. The worlds of *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* represents such constructions with delineation of names corresponding to players and places that reside solely within Tolkien's invented secondary worlds. The principal body of thirty some

⁶ Verlyn Flierger, *Splintered Light: Logos and Language in Tolkien's World* (Kent and London: Kent State University Press, 2002), p. xxi.

⁷ Tolkien created the illustrations for *The Hobbit*, *The Silmarillion*, *The Lord of the Rings*, *Farmer Giles of Ham*, *The Father Christmas Letters*, *Mr. Bliss*, and other texts.

known drawings and watercolors relating to *The Hobbit* are currently located in the collection of Oxford University's Bodleian Library. Additional preliminary sketches from the Hobbit comprise a part of the Tolkien Manuscript Collection, at Marquette University.

II. Tolkien and Cities

Although Tolkien offers no full-blown characterization of a city as it might be defined by urban theorists such as Lewis Mumford in his classic study, *The City in History: Its Origins, its Transformations and its Prospect* (1961), Kevin Lynch's *The Image of The City* (1960), or Edward Glaeser's *Triumph of the City* (2011), recent Tolkien scholarship has focused on the city as an important topic in *The Hobbit* and *Lord of the Rings*, two of Tolkien's major works.⁸ For example, Dominika Niez's essay, "The Forest and the City: the Dichotomy of Tolkien's Istari" considers the author's interest in contrasting city and forest. In this context two wizards, Radagast with connections to the forest life and nature, and Saruman identified with the city and the forces of industrialization offer a context for viewing city life in contrast to life in the forest.

Perhaps Tolkien's views of the city, may have been informed in part by his early experiences of life in Birmingham, England, a thriving industrial city where he spent a portion of his early life at the beginning of the twentieth century, prior to attending Oxford University. By the early twentieth century Birmingham would have become a thriving city with a history of architectural and industrial development and with the growing city problems that industrialization brought. How are these works related to the notion of cities as ways of world making? Tolkien himself grew up in the Edgbaston area of the city of Birmingham in the shadow of Perrott's Folly and the Victorian tower of Edgbaston Waterworks, possibly sources for images of the dark towers that appear in his works.⁹ Also a part of Tolkien's childhood environment was the Birmingham Museum and art Gallery with a collection which included fine art, natural history archaeology, as well as local history and industrial history.

⁸ Lewis Mumford, *The City in History: Its Origins, its Transformations and its Prospects* (USA: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1961). Kevin Lynch, *Image of the City* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1960), or Edward Glaeser, *Triumph of the City* (New York: Penguin Press, 2011).

⁹ *Jr. R. R. Tolkien Archived* 29 April 2011 at the Wayback Machine, Archives and Heritage Forum. Retrieved 27 April 2009. Cited

As it turns out, Tolkien favors the domain of the forest over city. This theme is developed in Conrad-O'Brian and Hynes (editors) Tolkien: *The Forest and the City* (2013).¹⁰ It would be an interesting study to explore whether or to what extent Tolkien's literary or visual images of city might have been influenced by the architecture and other aspects of his life in Birmingham. In any event, Tolkien favors life of the forest over city.

Let us turn to Tolkien's views on city as expressed in his *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings*. With respect to population, Hobbits, Elves, and Dwarfs are among those who reside in Tolkien's literary worlds. A Hobbit, the main character, is one of an imaginary people who populate the tales of J. R. Tolkien. 'Hobbits,' seemingly the main characters,' refers to people-like characters, who give themselves this name meaning "hole-dweller." They were referred to by others as "halflings," since they were half the height of normal men.¹¹ *The Hobbit* is populated with diverse occupants also including Dwarfs and Goblins along with Hobbits. These characters, whose interests are not always comfortable with each other, were also not immune to external threats, for example a dreaded dragon named Smaug. Similarly, quarrels leading to wars among the different sectors inaugurated conflicting interests and power struggles the likes of which we are familiar in the world outside of fiction.

The dwelling spaces in *The Hobbit* consist mainly of structures set in imaginary cities and landscapes in the midst of mountains and waterways. Although seemingly smaller in scale when compared to portrayal of cities depicted in *Lord of the Rings*, the cities depicted in *The Hobbit* entertain at least some of the characteristics that demarcate city. Within "*The Hobbit*" Tolkien assigns names to geographic locations with characteristics of cities. For example, Lake Town, Dale, Esgaroth, and Aberstore. Like city spaces in the non-fictional world, the cities in Tolkien's literary discourses include certain trademarks: City Gates and walls which regulate access and security is one of the marks of a city in the landscape of *The Hobbit*. Additional

¹⁰ Helen Conrad-O'Brian and Gerard Hynes, Editors, *Tolkien: The Forest and the City* (Four Court Press, 2013), 67-75.

¹¹ Humphrey Carpenter, editor with the assistance of Christopher Tolkien, *The Letters of J.R. R. Tolkien* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1981), No. 316, p. 405.

features of cities include Great Halls (the Hall of Feasting and of Council) that serve as gathering spaces symbolizing important community gatherings.

As the community of Esgaroth in *The Hobbit* assesses the damages to the city resulting from the battle with the defeated dragon Smaug, we find a model for addressing urban disaster. There is in Tolkien's narrative an understanding of key factors a city might address in a period of reconstruction after a major disruption of city life resulting from war or natural disasters. As we might expect, providing food for the needy and care of the sick and injured are among the first steps in responding to disaster. Questions about leadership, debates over whether a new regime or the existing is best suited to undertake the reconstruction, and attention to new plans for the future are among the considerations that the community of Esgaroth addresses. For example, should the Master retain his position as leader, or should the heroid Bard, ancestral descendant of the king, who had used his ancestral Black Arrow to destroy the Dragon lead the planning for restoration? After looking at the ruins of their city and the resources that could be utilized, including a store of gold previously guarded by the Dragon, the leaders of Esgaroth began planning a new city more fair and larger than before.¹² Such sentiments seem to echo the planning needs of cities in the modern world outside Tolkien's literary domain. Of course, the question of how to fund changes in the city depend on available resources. And here the citizens benefited from a treasure of gold liberated with the elimination of the guardian of the treasure, the Dragon had previously controlled.

Tolkien's fictive world of *the Hobbit* is not immune from the kinds of group discrimination based on difference among its populations which contaminates the world that we inhabit for example, Beorn, a character in *The Hobbit*, expresses the view that he is not overly fond of Dwarfs. On the other hand, this same character Beorn, while cautioning against trusting any one you did not know, warmly extends hospitality and equips his visitors with food and ponies to continue their journey thru Mirkwood forest and homeward.

¹² J. R. R. Tolkien, *The Hobbit* (London, Sidney: Unwin & Hyman, Anniversary Edition, 1987), 216.

Tolkien's account of cities continues in *The Lord of the Rings* as the characters journey thru the lands. In *Fellowship of the Ring*, Part I of *Lord of the Rings*, is an account of the city Minas Tirath as viewed from a distance by the character Frodo in the midst of battle: "Far away it seemed and beautiful: white washed, many-towered, proud and fair upon its mountain-seat; its battlements glittered with steel, and its turrets were bright with many banners."¹³ In Part Three, Book 5, the city of Minas Tirith is described thusly: "For the fashion of Minas Tirith was such that it was built on seven levels, each delved into the hill, and about each was a set wall, and in each wall a gate. Pippin gazed in growing wonder at the great stone city, vaster and more splendid than anything that he had dreamed of...." 782

In contrast to the imagined cities in *The Lord of the Rings* is the account of the Old Forest: "...The Forest is queer. Everything in it is very much more alive, more aware of what is going on so to speak And the trees do not like strangers. They are usually content merely to watch you, as long as daylight lasts, and don't do much. ... But at night things can be most alarming....I thought all the trees were whispering to each other, passing news and plots along in an unintelligible language, and the branches swayed and groped without any wind."¹⁴

The city in Tolkien's literary schemes anticipate some of the problems of cities with their focus on the changing character of cities and the problems they must address in the face of changes due to war and natural disaster. His imaginative descriptions point to creative constructions that anticipate the modern cities, but without the interactive technologies that have not yet arrived even in imagination.

* Hence works of fiction such as J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* command a significant role in worldmaking. They function not as literal description, but as a metaphorical alternative world view that may actually live in the experiences of those who read Tolkien's text or view his visual images, or otherwise participate. As works of literature, Tolkien's constructed worlds are not the world of the physicist, or of the people we meet on the

¹³ J. R. R. Tolkien, *Fellowship of the Ring: Lord of the Rings* (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1954, 1965) p. 417.

¹⁴ J. R.R. Tolkien, *The Fellowship of the Ring, The Lord of the Rings*, Part I (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1992), p. 125.

street. But they may nevertheless inform and enrich the worlds of both. His visual art augments the literary scenes found in his books.

* Hence works of fiction such as J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* command a significant role in worldmaking. They function not as literal description, but as a metaphorical alternative world view that may actually live in the experiences of those who read Tolkien's text or view his visual images, or otherwise participate. As works of literature, Tolkien's constructed worlds are not the world of the physicist, or of the people we meet on the street. But they may nevertheless inform and enrich the worlds of both. His visual art augments the literary scenes found in his books.

Tolkien's landscapes cover the world of Middle earth "from domestic interiors to mountain ranges" and provide "intimate over views, interior views, closed off perspectives, panoramic visita, and dramatic approaches" to enable the reader enter into his fantasy world.¹⁵

III. World Making in Mahagony

At times artists see as their role to challenge or critique the options accessible in city life. Then, city life itself may become becomes an object for satiric critique as In Kurt Weil Berthold Brecht's "Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny." This satirical musical production, first presented in the 1930s during the Nazi era in Germany, sets forth in song and drama the conditions of an imagined ideal city life gone awry. It offers a critique both of social conditions and human vulnerabilities, and perhaps of the musical form of the opera itself. Weil was not alone in his challenge to the narratives of life in Germany at the time. He was joined by radical artists including the painter Otto Dix and architect Mies Vander Rohe, cabaret performers and other artists deemed degenerate in the eyes of the Third Reich leaders.

Initially the city structure of Mahagonny was intended as a model city aimed at offering useful services to its residents. But this model soon degenerates as abuses of power and greed lead to corruption. The fictive city of Mahagonny in Weil/ Brecht's theatrical creation is intended as a parable of city culture gone awry as it fosters an environment where

¹⁵ Richard Schindler, *The Expectant Landscape*, J.R. R. Tolkien's Illustrations for the *Hobbit*, J.R.R. Tolkien: *The Hobbit: Drawings, Watercolors, and Manuscripts*, Exhibition Catalogue (Milwaukee: Marquette University, June 11-September 30, 1987), pp. 17-19.

commodification of goods and services leads to the demise of bourgeois civility. The extreme of life in Weill/Brecht's fictive city shows poverty as a crime warranting punishment. The aim of his music including jazz rhythms in the context of classical musical forms was to "get people involved and thinking." At the time of its introduction Weill's musical productions posed a challenge to life in the state of Weimar Germany, and especially to the emerging Nazi view of Culture, making necessary the artist's exile to the United States. There he collaborated with Moss Hart, Ira Gershwin, and Langston Hughes in enriching the cultural life of another live city with Broadway musical successes: New York.¹⁶

Despite its dour lessons referencing city life in disarray, "Mahagonny" continues to enjoy periodic revivals. In addition to US productions in New Haven in 1974 and 1978, and at the Metropolitan Opera in New York, in 1979, Los Angeles in 2017 its productions continue in theaters across the world. There is now (2017) a festival in Dessau, Germany, home of the Avant garde Bauhaus, where Weill is increasingly celebrated including a recent production of "The Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny." The continuation of recurring revivals of Weill's enigmatic commentary on city life, reminds us that one of the ways in which art has functioned in city life, is by continuously reviving the arts of the past through restaging and reinterpreting past contributions.

A moment of reflection on the decadent conditions of life in Weill's city, reminds us that our current state of city life also faces many challenges, perhaps not yet as extreme as the deteriorated conditions of Mahagonny. To be sure some of our problems such as corruption emerge from deficiencies in human character. But more pertinent to our concerns here are such issues as the increased commodification of city life, poverty, and the de-emphasis on the values previously transferred thru humanities studies in the study of history, literature, languages and philosophy. Among the growing concerns are problems that we may be able to address are those following form models of urban planning without adequate regard to implications for human welfare. Or how will the liberation of people from current work demands though the intervention of robotic more efficient means of production be implemented without loss of important ways of realizing human potential?. What then will be the role of the arts in these new social processes?

¹⁶ Joshua Barone, "Kurt Weill: How Germany Finally Unearthed a National Treasure," *New York Times*, March 9, 2017.

How will art and aesthetics fare in these social changes? What new forms will the arts that emerge in the new forms of city life that are already emerging?

*World making can occur in music as well as in visual and literary arts. The opera, “Ride and Fall of the City of Mahagony” by Kurt Weil and Berthold Brecht, first presented in the 1930s during the Nazi era in Germany, sets forth in song and drama the conditions of an imagined city life gone awry. Initially, the city of Mahagony was intended as a model city aimed at offering useful services to its residents. But this model soon degenerates as abuses of power and greed lead an environment where commodification of goods and services leads to the demise of bourgeois civilities. Mahagony as represented by Brecht and Weil exhibits It offers a critique both of social conditions and human vulnerabilities that may take place in the process of world making.

IV. XU Bing: Dragon Fly Eyes

Taking the argument to a contemporary stance where film is the medium, Chinese artist Xu Bing’s recent film, “Dragon Fly Eyes.” released in 2017. This “cameraless” experimental film making project based on footage acquired from some 500 surveillance cameras and online streaming images. The film ostensibly narrates a simple story centering on the lives of two characters, Wing Ting (Dragon fly) and her boyfriend Siao Xiao as they navigate thru a series of identity changes in contemporary Chinese city life. But it also shows the strains of every day urban life of the twenty-first century. While the artist in this work seems mainly concerned with unlocking new aspects of creating art film, no doubt this new venture of Xu Bing will heighten the realization of the role that surveillance devices have assumed in twenty-first century life. It will generate conversations and concerns over the millions of security camera that focus on nearly all aspects of life contemporary urban life, whether in Beijing or New York or London, from the maintenance of street traffic and public safety to national security uses and possibly intrusions into the privacy important to everyday life. Apart from its creative advances to experimental film making, this work vividly draws our attention to what may well be a grave threat to values based on personal freedom in urban life.

Among Xu Bing’s never-ending pursuit of new challenges, is “Dragon Fly Eyes,” released in 2017. This “cameraless” experimental film making project based on footage acquired from some 500 surveillance cameras and on line streaming images, was shown in the New York Film

Festival in 1917 and is included in the Ullens Center exhibition. The film ostensibly narrates a simple story centering on the lives of two characters, Wing Ting (Dragon fly) and her boyfriend Siao Xiao as they navigate thru a series of identity changes in contemporary Chinese life. But it also shows the strains of every day urban life of the twenty-first century. While the artist in this work seems mainly concerned with unlocking new aspects of creating art film, no doubt this new venture of Xu Bing will heighten the realization of the role that surveillance devices have assumed in twenty-first century life. it will generate conversations and concerns over the millions of security camera that focus on nearly all aspects of life contemporary urban life, whether in Beijing or New York or London, from the maintenance of street traffic and public safety to national security uses and possibly intrusions into the privacy important to everyday life. Apart from its creative advances to experimental film making, this work vividly draws our attention to what may well be a grave threat to values based on personal freedom.

V. Hudson Yards

Taking the discussion of Ways of World Making into the actual world of cities, I will discuss the contemporary city as a form of world making by examining the latest city development in New York City called “Hudson Yards” which opened officially in March of 2019. This contribution to world making joins other such projects such as the 92 acre publicly developed “Battery Park City completed in 2011, and Lincoln Center, created in 1955, which is currently the cultural hub of the city housing major performance spaces of dance, theater and music in New York. Unlike the publicly developed 92 acre “Battery Park City” embodying the urban ideals of Jane Jacobs, Hudson Yards consists of a privately developed 28-acre section of Manhattan along Tenth Avenue over what previously served as a 30 track Hudson Yards rail yard.¹⁷ “The development has reimagined a neighborhood once dominated by rundown industrial buildings and auto repair shops as an architectural landmark.”¹⁸

Unlike previous urban projects such as Battery Park Hudson Yards has proceeded under coordination by a single development company headed by Stephen Ross. Hudson Yards as it now exists includes a cluster of residential, commercial, retail, and cultural spaces featuring high

¹⁷ C. J. Hughes, “Giants Within A City of Giants,” *The New York Times*, April 7, 2-19, p. 10.

¹⁸ Barbara Goldberg, “Hudson Yards Redraws New York Skyline,” *Reuters*, March 15, 2019.

rise towers containing office spaces, apartments, an extensive mall and green spaces. Taking note of increasing terrorist threats, Hudson Yards developers are mindful of security needs and ability to cope with natural disasters. Its features apply the latest technology in its systems including its own power system, rainwater collection system, and protection against storm systems, and of course elaborate security features.¹⁹

A centerpiece of the project is “The Shed,” a \$475 million dollar art center. The aim of the planners for the Shed was to create a highly flexible cultural entity with architecture that would encourage artists to break out of their narrowly construed discipline based offerings and connect with other disciplines: dancers with visual artists, musicians with theatrical performances aimed at reaching a greater degree of the population.²⁰

Mention Sculpture Here

All of the worldmaking elements set forth in the Hudson Park project at the moment anticipate a next stage in world making representing a new stage in city development. Such a development generates hope for improvements, enrichments in future development of the city. But such developments are now without their critics. New York Times Architecture Critic Michael Kimmelman finds Hudson Yards lacking in a semblance of human scale. “...Hudson Yards glorifies a kind of surface spectacle—as if the peak ambitions of city life were consuming luxury goods and enjoying a smooth, seductive, mindless materialism.”²¹

Looking at this newest manifestation of world making from a more distant perspective, it is interesting to consider the reception of Hudson Yards from the perspective of Jane Jacobs, urban activist and urban planner who challenged the urban planning ideals of the 1950s to 1970s and questioned the value of tall buildings isolated from street life.²²

Change and Hudson Yards

¹⁹ Peter Grant, “Hudson Yards Design is Like a Fortress,” *The Wallstreet Journal*, March 13, 2019.

²⁰ Michael Cooper, “Can the Shed Redeem Hudson Yards?,” *New York Times*, March 31, 2019.

²¹ Michael Kimmelman, “Hudson Yards is Manhattan’s Biggest, Newest, Slickest Gated Community,” *The New York Times*, March 14, 2019.

²² Jane Jacobs, *The Death and Life of Great American Cities* (New York: Random House, 1961.) Edward Glaeser, *Triumph of the City* (New York: The Penguin Group, 2011), 142-148.

See Glaeser 162 and 260

Security

VII. Ways of Worldmaking and Values

The Arts, Economics, Nature

Quote: “This is how urban folk choose to live: a defined neighborhood that represents their values and aspirations, set in amongst others of a different identity,” Patricia Derrington, Director of the Center of Urban Real Estate, Columbia University, in ¹ Barbara Goldberg, “Hudson Yards Redraws New York Skyline,” *Reuters*, March 15, 2019. one tenth affordable housing according to Related spokesperson Jessica Scaperotti to Reuters.

Statistics: Developers Related Companies and Oxford Properties: 100 plus stores, 25 restaurants, 4000 residential units, 1 million square feet of office space

Critics of Hudson Yards:

Michael Kimmelman architecture critic of the New York Times has questioned Hudson Yards see NYT March 14, 2019. “Hudson Yards is Manhattan’s Biggest, Newest, Slickest Gated Community:

Quote: Michael Kimmelman architecture critic NYT : “Hudson Yards glorifies a kind of surface spectacle—as if the peak ambitions of city life were consuming luxury goods and enjoying a smooth, seductive, mindless materialism.”

City and State : Provided tax incentives, Added an extension of No. 7 subway line billions of public subsidy

Designers: Kohn, Pederson Fox for master plan of Hudson

A Museum of Architecture and a whole new way of life Everything at your doorstep : Frank Gehry, Herzog and de Meuron, Santiago Calatrave, Robert A. M Stern

The Vessel Inspired by ancient Indian stepwells, 150 feet high \$200 Million dollar latticed, stairway to nowhere sheathed in copper-cladded steel

Location: NY 30th & e4th N&S and 10th and 12th on East and West.

Cost of Hudson Yards

2.4 billion to extend No 7 subway

1.4 billion for 4 acres of parks and open space

359 million in interest on bonds

Developer Stephen Ross

Did the buildings of Yards fit NY CITY?

United Nations NY COMplex