

10-1-2011

Review of George Tyrrell and Catholic Modernism

David G. Schultenover

Marquette University, david.schultenover@marquette.edu

gion, but the increased vitality of the other two elements is the subtext of this fine collection of historical explorations.

Fordham University

TERRENCE W. TILLEY

George Tyrrell and Catholic Modernism. Edited and introduced by Oliver P. Rafferty. (Dublin: Four Courts Press. Distrib. ISBS, Portland, OR. 2010. Pp. 187. \$65.00. ISBN 978-1-846-82236-0.)

This collection of strong contributions to Roman Catholic modernism studies originated from a laudable desire to commemorate George Tyrrell, a so-called modernist and former member of the English Province of the Society of Jesus, on the centenary of his death. Oliver Rafferty's chapter I historically contextualizes what follows. The book's centerpiece is Clara Ginther's superb essay on Tyrrell's seminal article, "The Relation of Theology to Devotion" (1899). Ginther smartly shows how this article gives his corpus coherence. Anthony Maher's equally superb essay on Tyrrell's ecclesiology flows from his understanding of "devotion" as rooted in religious experience, which, in Tyrrell's case, was grounded in his Ignatian spirituality and Christology. For Tyrrell, religious experience is what primarily authorizes, a view that coheres with Blessed Cardinal John Henry Newman's view of authority: It is, first of all, internal. Out of a thorough knowledge of Tyrrell's writings, Maher shows how false was the ecclesiology of Pope Pius X and Cardinal Merry del Val compared to Tyrrell's, which inveighed against an idolatrous ultramontanist that led to abuse of authority such as virtually ignoring the religious experience of the laity and regarding bishops as mere delegates of the pope. Readers will find cogent resonances between Tyrrell's ecclesiology and what many Catholics today desperately long for. The richness of these two essays suggests that Ginther and Maher are working on monographs. They are to be strongly encouraged.

Andrew Pierce's essay on the relationship between Tyrrell and Newman is the very best of a substantial body of such literature. This work is especially helpful in showing how Tyrrell could emerge from a formation in neo-Scholastic philosophy and theology into a mode of thinking that was open to what could be most fruitfully mined of Enlightenment and post-Enlightenment thought for Catholic theology. However, Pierce's characterization as "bizarre" of my failure to include Newman under "greater and lesser lights" (in *George Tyrrell*, [Shepherdstown, WV, 1981], pp. 189–207) may be misguided. I think I made it clear that Tyrrell regarded Newman as not so much a greater or lesser light in his firmament, but as the supernova that guided him toward a more fruitful way of reflection than could be found in neo-Scholasticism.

The other essays in the collection are complementary. Certainly not to be missed is Anthony Carroll's "The Philosophical Foundations of Catholic Modernism." The essays by Michael Hurley and Michael Kirwan interestingly

relate Tyrrell's thought to "ecumenical spirituality" and "the theology of Vatican II." Rafferty rounds off the collection with a poignant, if derivative, treatment of Tyrrell's relationship to the Jesuits of his English province.

This text is best suited for graduate students. Although uneven in terms of richness and marred by inconsistent copyediting, the essays are intelligently conceived and well written. This valuable collection belongs in every academic library.

Marquette University

DAVID G. SCHULTENOVER, S.J.

Dietrich Bonhoeffer Works, Vol. 8: Letters and Papers from Prison, English Edition. Edited by John W. de Gruchy; translated by Isabel Best, Lisa E. Dahill, Reinhard Krauss, and Nancy Lukens. "After Ten Years" translated by Barbara and Martin Rumscheidt, and supplementary material translated by Douglas W. Stott. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 2010. Pp. xxiii, 750. \$60.00. ISBN 978-0-800-69703-7).

Fortress Press has devoted nearly two decades to the publication of sixteen annotated volumes of Dietrich Bonhoeffer's writings. The arrival of volume 8, *Letters and Papers from Prison*, means that only two volumes, 11 and 15, remain in this prodigious undertaking that is now under the general editorship of Victoria Barnett and Barbara Wojhoski and assisted by numerous Bonhoeffer scholars and translators. The entire project relies, of course, on the original German edition, edited by Bonhoeffer's friend and biographer, Eberhard Bethge, plus seven others, and completed in 1998. Few theologians or historical figures inspire this level of interest and effort. It is clear, however, that Bonhoeffer is worthy of the attention. He first emerged in the 1950s and 1960s as a major figure of both historical and theological interest. It is now clear that Bonhoeffer was no passing fad.

A large part of the interest in Bonhoeffer rests on his nearly unique response to the horrors perpetrated by Germans under Hitler. Instead of welcoming him, as many Christians mistakenly did, Bonhoeffer opposed Hitler and the Nazi ideology from the start. Furthermore, after he could not convince even the Confessing Church to criticize Nazism as he did, he joined the conspiracy trying to overthrow the regime. This activity led to his arrest and imprisonment in April 1943, followed by his execution in April 1945, even as the Nazi regime was crumbling. We now admire Bonhoeffer's political insight and moral courage. Bonhoeffer also emerged as one of the most influential Protestant theologians in the second half of the twentieth century.

All sixteen volumes give us important access to Bonhoeffer; however, this volume concentrates on two of the most central aspects of his story: the human cost of his courage and martyrdom and the radical nature of his theology for "a world come of age." *Letters and Papers from Prison* also is the book—now greatly enlarged, heavily annotated, and newly translated—which