Winter 2015

Tokens in A Man's World: Women in Creative Advertising Departments

Jean M. Grow
Marquette University, jean.grow@mu.edu

Tao Deng
Marquette University

Research In Depth

Tokens in a Man's World: Women in Advertising Creative Departments

By Jean M. Grow and Tao Deng

Jean M. Grow is an Associate Professor at Marquette University. She earned her Ph.D. from the University of Wisconsin–Madison. Jean's research explores the global under-representation of women in advertising creative departments. She has numerous scholarly publications and has presented research and taught around the world. Prior to joining the academy Jean worked as an artists' representative. Her clients included: Coca Cola and Kellogg's as well as DDB, Draftfcb, and Leo Burnett. She continues to consult with clients such as Flamingo International/London, Nike and the National Hemophilia Foundation. She can be found at: @jeangrow and growculturalgeography.wordpress.com/.

Tao Deng is a doctoral student in the Media Information Studies Ph.D. program at the Michigan State University. His research interests broadly include cross-cultural advertising effects and consumer behavior. Tao has extensive media professional experience, including editorial positions in the China Daily, Guangzhou Daily *and project management in ad agency in Hong Kong.*

As consumerism evolves across the global landscape, so should innovation and creativity. Yet an examination of the global advertising landscape finds a lack of gender diversity within advertising creative departments (Nixon, 2003). Literature from the past decade has recorded a severe underrepresentation of women on creative teams despite the fact that women make 80-85% of all consumer decisions (Grow & Broyles, 2011; Mallia, 2009a). Creative women do not reach proportional representation, which is greater than 35%, and in many creative departments they are tokens with less than 15% representation (Kanter, 1977). Few women in creative pursuits hobbles the potential depth and breadth of creative options (Windels, 2011). With women driving consumption it begs the question: why are there so few women creating the messaging?

Literature Review

Lack of proportional representation is not a new problem. It has a long history in advertising creative departments. The majority of past studies have explored the underrepresentation of women in the creative departments solely in the Western world (Grow, Roca & Broyles, 2012; Klein, 2000; Mallia, 2009a; Nixon, 2003; Windels, 2011). Yet a global perspective could determine possible patterns and highlight possible new insights. Thus, the current study, utilizing the 2013 Standard Directory of Advertising Agencies (hereafter known as Red Books), explores the underrepresentation of women in advertising creative through a multidimensional model of gender distribution, exploring the possibility of both horizontal (general representation) and vertical (senior level representation) dimensions, utilizing both the Hofstede model (Hofstede, 2001) and the Project GLOBE (House et al., 2004). It uncovers a multidimensional picture of gender distribution in the advertising creative departments in 50 countries.

Proportional Representation and Tokenism. In her seminal work on tokenism, Kanter (1977) argues that the proportion of women within organizations is crucial to their performance and efficiency. Kanter's (1977) work is framed by four groups: uniform, balanced, tilted and skewed. Uniform groups consist of one significant social type with 100% representation, reflecting the dominant culture. Balanced groups have a typological ratio from 60:40 to 50:50 with the minority as subgroups. Tilted groups are those where the minority reaches a proportional representation of at least 35%, where the minority can exert only modest influence over the group's culture. Finally, skewed groups exhibit a culture that is controlled by the dominant demographic group(s), which has a proportion of more than 85%, where minorities make up less than 15% and become tokens.

Windels (2011) looked at women working in creative departments and found that compared with individuals in a majority position (men), individuals in the minority (women) showed significantly lower mean creativity scores. This could reflect the level of their talent; however, it is more likely that it reflects hostile environmental pres-

sures. A hostile environment, in which women are far from the majority and often tokens, may impact both how creative is perceived and the creative process itself. Kanter's (1977) work suggests that tokenism is associated with three perceptual phenomena: visibility, polarization, and assimilation. Heightened visibility creates performance pressures; polarization leads to isolation from social and professional networks; and assimilation generates stereotyped role entrapment for women, common within creative departments (Grow & Broyles, 2011). Further, Lemons (2003) argues that "gender segregation may result in a token status for women when they attempt to enter upper-management levels that are usually dominated by men. This situation creates pressure because women become visible whether they want to be or not" (p. 259). Thus, a hostile environmental context is a huge detriment of women's promotional success.

We know that gender segregation begins early and is reinforced in the workplace. Dahlerup (1998) suggests that women with agency and resources offer the critical promise for change, even from a token position. Lemons (2003) might suggest otherwise. However, "leaning in" (Sandberg, 2013) as a token can be a perilous proposition as it challenges the status quo. These arguments resonate with Ely's (1990) contention that senior managerial women can influence policies and practices within their organizations.

Horizontal and Vertical Dimensions in Creative Departments. Prior studies have demonstrated that women are severely underrepresented in the advertising creative departments in the United States, United Kingdom, Spain and Sweden, with none reaching 35% proportional representation (Broyles & Grow, 2008; Grow, Roca & Broyles, 2012; Klein, 2000; Mallia, 2009b; Mallia & Windels, 2011; Windels & Lee, 2012). To expand the field of knowledge we accessed data from 50 countries, embracing both horizontal (general representation) and vertical (senior-level representation) dimensions (see Figure 1) to explore gender dynamics within advertising creative departments globally.

Horizontal measures may reveal a "glass wall" (Guy, 1994), a horizontal barrier that keeps men or women from moving freely between positions or departments (Still, 1997). In this study, the horizontal dimension measures the extent to which female creatives are denied access to the department and obstructions to retention. Thus the following research question, addressing horizontal distribution, is posed:

RQ 1: How is gender distributed horizontally (proportion of female creatives) within the advertising creative departments?

A second point of reference is vertical orientations. Kanter (1977) points out that the proportion of women at senior levels is crucial to the experience of women at all levels. Strong vertical gender divisions often coexisted with women's struggle to attain and perform in leadership roles (Alvesson, 1998). Hence an exploration of the vertical dimension is imperative, as it addresses unequal status hierarchy within an occupation. The vertical dimension is an "artificial career barrier based on attitudinal or [organizational] bias that prevents qualified individuals from advancing upward in the [organization] and from reaching their full potential" (Still, 1997, p. 10). Lemons reminds us that "evidence of a glass ceiling for women is abundant" (2003, p. 248).

Women account for 56% of those employed within advertising agencies, according to the United States Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC, 2010); they made up less than 3% of senior executive positions (Sivulka, 2009). In the United Kingdom women hold only 5% of chief executive positions in media companies (Gregory, 2009). Recently the number of senior level women in advertising in the United Kingdom has increased from 13.5% in 2011 to 21.5% in 2012 (IPA, 2012). In France, women take up 17% of governance roles in news media (Byerly, 2011). In Germany, women hold only 10% of senior advertising creative management positions (Pueyo Ayhan, 2010) and in Spain they hold only 10% (Martín-Llaguno, 2007). In Sweden, women hold 20% of advertising agency CEO positions but also 36% of management roles (KOMM, 2012). To identify

the vertical distribution of female Creative Directors globally, the following research question is posed:

RQ 2: How is gender distributed vertically (proportion of female Creative Directors) within the advertising creative department?

Models of National Culture

Often specific occupations, such as advertising creative, may not be generalizable to the overall workforce. However, when enough data are collected, some systemic cultural differences may appear. Thus, combining horizontal and vertical data within a broad cross-cultural study offers new possibilities for insights. Specifically, the proportion of female creatives and national culture can be explored, which could open possibilities for future studies to drill down by individual national culture or possible clusters of cultures with commonalities.

Hofstede's cultural dimension model (de Mooij & Hofstede, 2010; Hofstede, 2001) and the more recent GLOBE model (House et al., 2004), have provided scholars and practitioners with valuable insights into the dynamics of national cultures. Few studies have used both models.

Hofstede's pioneering cultural research conducted in the 1980s is the most celebrated of its kind (Hofstede, 1997). His early work identified four bipolar dimensions: power distance (PDI), individualism/collectivism (IDV), masculinity/femininity (MAS), and uncertainty avoidance (UAI) (Hofstede, 2001). PDI refers to the extent to which power and wealth inequality is tolerated. IDV is a measure of how people value working alone or in groups. MAS measures the degree to which masculine traits are preferred to female characteristics. UAI identifies the extent to which people feel threatened by uncertainty and ambiguity and, subsequently, try to avoid these situations.

The GLOBE study was constructed in the mid-1990s and reflects influences from Hofstede's model. It is based on nine cultural dimensions (House et al., 2004), of which four are relevant to this study: assertiveness, gender egalitarianism, performance orientation, and uncertainty avoidance. Each dimension was measured by two scales: practices (the way things are) and values (the way things should be). The GLOBE model's assertiveness and gender egalitarianism are originated from Hofstede's MAS dimension (House et al., 2004), while assertiveness correlates significantly with MAS (de Mooij, 2013). It might appear that GLOBE dimensions share some similarities in the concepts with the Hofstede model. In fact the two models are quite different in purpose and design; each has distinctive conceptual content of dimensions (de Mooij, 2013). Definitions of the Hofstede dimensions can be seen in Table 1. Based on the two models of cultural dimensions, the following research question is raised:

RQ 3: What are the relationships, if any, between female creatives' horizontal and vertical proportions and national cultural dimensions?

Method

We turned to the online Red Books, an established advertising industry database, and one not commonly used in academic research. The Red Books database comprises over 200,000 practitioners' profiles from more than 15,000 agencies in 124 countries. Despite some shortcomings, such as self-reporting and a concentration on developed countries, Red Books is still the most credible and detailed advertising industry resource. Thus, it is the ideal data source to explore gender distribution relative to this study.

Data Selection. A five-step process was conducted between February and July 2013. (1) Countries with a Gross Domestic Product (GDP) greater than $100 billion USD were selected. (2) Agencies within the resulting countries with less than 10 employees were discarded. (3) Countries with less than five agencies listed were removed, generating a dataset with 1,915 agencies from 50 countries. (4) The dataset of 3,069 individuals was segmented by function: Creative Director (CD), Art Director (AD) and Copywriter (CW). (5) Individuals were screened by gender, with unconfirmed individuals removed from the pool. A final dataset of 3,048 CDs, ADs and CWs from 50 countries remained. After removing outliers, data from 41 countries were selected and examined using both Hofstede's national cultural dimensions and the GLOBE model (see Appendix 2 for details).

Analytic Process. Horizontal gender distribution was measured by female creatives' ratio within all agencies reported by Red Books within each country. Vertical dimension was measured by the percentage of female CDs among the entire CD population of an individual country as reported by Red Books. Both dimensional data sets were examined by country and within five geographic regions: Asia Pacific, Europe, Latin America, Middle East and Africa, and North America. The countries' data are the dependent variable while the quantitative values for each of the four Hofstede dimensions and six GLOBE

dimensions are the independent variable. Pearson correlation analyses were run for each of the cultural dimensions against countries' data to test the level of correlation.

Discussion of Findings

Globally, women account for only 20.3% of all creative positions and 14.6% of CD roles within the initial dataset of 3,048 creative individuals in 1,915 agencies across 50 countries and five regions. Overall, the data from this study demonstrate that across cultures women are rare among creative management ranks and are, as a group, deemed as less creatively productive. In short, women in creative are under immense stress.

Horizontal Distribution. Let us consider the first research question. How is gender distributed horizontally (proportion of female creatives) within the advertising creative departments? It is clear there is a significant lack of equity. Specifically, the findings show strong marginalization in the horizontal distribution of creative women in the advertising creative departments.

Asia Pacific (13 countries including Australia and New Zealand) demonstrates moderate female participations with an overall percentage of 22.8%, slightly higher than the global average of 20.3%. Among Asian societies, Hong Kong and the Philippines show the highest percentage of women at 37.5% and 41.7% respectively, both exceeding proportional representation. However, it is worth noting that roughly 90% of the agencies listed in non-Western countries are subsidiaries of multinational corporations.

Also reaching the proportional representation are three countries in Europe: Greece (58.3%), Italy (35.2%) and Poland (38.1%), though these may be outliners. In fact, female representation is below 20% generally in Europe, which strongly suggests a male dominant creative culture. Latin America (seven countries) shows an even starker masculinization within creative with female creative participation below 5%. Argentina and Venezuela list zero female creatives. Brazil, the largest country in Latin America, records only a 7.9% female participation rate. Among Middle Eastern countries (four countries), on average creative women make up only 14.8% of the creative team. There is only one country in Africa that satisfied the research criteria of GDP>$100 billion USD. That was South Africa and it demonstrates a moderate female representation at 26.3%. Finally, in North America, which had the largest pool represented within Red Books, the

United States shows creative women at a rate of 27.7%. Yet, there were just 173 creative women across 548 agencies. Canada came in at 23.1% women in creative. It is significant to note that neither the United States nor Canada reaches proportional representation.

Global results point to a ratio of women to men in the creative workforce close to 1:4, with women representing only 20.3% of all advertising creatives globally. Among countries that are considered major international advertising forces and home to major multinational agencies, such as France, Great Britain, Japan or the United States, not a single one has women reaching proportional representation.

Yet, proportional representation is the very criterion necessary for women to exert influence over the masculine creative culture (Ely, 1995; Ibarra, 1997; Kanter, 1997). Even more troubling, 17 countries show creative women at token levels or below. France, home to Publicis Omnicom Group, the world's largest multinational advertising agency, has only 14.4% female creatives; while the United Kingdom, home to WPP Group, the world's second largest multinational advertising agency, has only 13.9% women. Within a token culture women lack of visibility and there is polarization leading to great difficulty assimilating (Kanter, 1997).

More alarming, the number of female creatives appears to be in decline. In 2005 *Advertising Age* reported women account for 31.3% of all creatives in the United States (Advertising Age, 2005). This study, nearly ten years later, shows women at only 27.7%. Similarly, comparing this study to past studies from the West we also see declining numbers of female creatives. Klein found creative women at 15% in the United Kingdom in 2000 (Klein, 2000); today we find 13.9%. In 2000 Klein found creative women at 30% in Sweden (Klein, 2000); today we find 20.7%. Finally, in 2010 Pueyo Ayhan found creative women at 19.4% in Spain (Pueyo Ayhan, 2010); today we find 18.9%. There appears to be not only a lack or proportional representation but also declining number of women in creative. Despite the obvious differences in methodology across these studies, the comparative findings across time nonetheless suggest a "glass wall" (Guy, 1994) that continues to impact women's ability to be hired and retained within creative departments globally.

Vertical Distribution. Now we consider the second research question. How is gender distributed vertically (proportion of female Creative Directors) within the advertising creative departments? While the "glass wall" (Guy, 1994) refers to horizontal distribution, the "glass ceiling" (Morrison, White & Van Velsor, 1987) refers to vertical distribution, which is an artificial barrier damaging women's ability to reach their full potential. In fact, the data suggest that for women seeking to move up

into creative management there may be a nearly impermeable "plexiglas ceiling" (Flewellen, Broyles & Grow, 2011).

In Asia Pacific, female CDs are rare, except for in China (100%), the Philippines (100%) and Vietnam (50%). Yet, these may be outliners as all three reflect very small sample sizes in Red Books. Australia and New Zealand show extremely modest female CD representation with 15% in Australia and 16.7% in New Zealand. The findings demonstrate that Asia Pacific also has only a small percentage of female CDs at 14.3%. In Europe female CDs make up just 11.8% of creative management. Latin American countries demonstrate extremely low numbers of female CDs with only 6.5%. Peru has the highest female CDs rate at 33.3%, but only 3% females creatives overall. Argentina, Chile, Colombia and Venezuela list no female CDs. The trend of no or extremely few female CDs is most severe in Middle East and Africa, where Saudi Arabia lists only one female CD. Among those with zero female CDs are Egypt, Israel, South Africa and United Arab Emirates. In North America there appears to be moderate female CD representation. American women represent 25.2% of CDs, while Canadian women represent 11.8% of CDs.

These findings demonstrate severe proportional scarcity of senior creative women globally, with a ratio of women to men in CD positions setting at about 1:6 or 14.6%. This clearly represents tokenism of the severest nature or a "skewed" group (Kanter, 1997). There are ten countries with female CDs that are above tokenism but below proportional representation. Two are in the Asia Pacific region: New Zealand at 16.7% and South Korea at 33.3%. Five are in Europe: Czech Republic at 33.3%, Italy at 27.7%, Portugal at 20%, Russia at 16.7% and Switzerland at 20%. In Latin America there is only one: Peru at 33%. In the Middle East and Africa only Saudi Arabia at 20% fits this category. In North America there is only the United States at 25.2%. Considering baseline markers for masculinity in the Hofstede models it would appear that Italy, Peru and Saudi Arabia may be outliers. Further, both Peru and Saudi Arabia have small data sets and so too may be outliers.

Few countries reach "balanced" representation of 40-60% (Kanter, 1997), including most of those from the developed world. Only five countries had "balanced" representation, two in Europe: Poland with 60% and Sweden with 50%; and three in Asia: China and the Philippines both at 100% and Vietnam at 50%, though the sample sets remain small. Further,

the agencies are multinationals and management may be facilitated from beyond the geographic boundaries of an individual country. Additionally, these cultures are marked by a highly female workforce (The World Bank, 2013). Only one country, Sweden, has markers within the Hofstede and GLOBE models, which would support its 50% findings within vertical distribution. It appears that creative leadership is marked by masculine domination.

Strong vertical gender divisions often co-exist with creative women's struggle to become leaders. Working under this cloud of masculinity, it appears that junior creative women too often do not possess the resources nor the bargaining power to move to the top (Alvesson, 1998; Ibarra, 1997). Senior level women are needed as mentors and role models and promoters of female-friendly policies, which are needed to achieve a more gender-neutral organization culture (Ibarra, 1997; Kanter, 1977; Ridgeway, 1988; Rosener, 1990; Sandberg, 2103). With the dismal global average of only 14.6% female CDs, which is clearly at token level, it is fair to say that systemic change is needed to empower creative women. Empowering creative women hinges on actions from people in power.

The current findings indicate there is a moderate interaction between the horizontal and vertical dimensions applying Pearson correlations analysis ($r=.38$, $p<.005$). The results suggest that while the horizontal barriers impede creative women from moving in, vertical obstacles keep them from moving up. Severely "skewed" (Kanter, 1977) gender proportion in horizontal and vertical dimensions could result in compromising the women's success in creative departments, in part because the "skewed" constructs exacerbates inequality. Additionally, we know women make 80-85% of the total consumption decisions (Grow & Broyles, 2011; Mallia, 2009a). Thus, at a very practical level, these data suggest that the creative environment is detrimental for creative women striving to advance, just as is it is detrimental to clients who could benefit from their perspectives. In the end, the dramatic global underrepresentation of women across both the horizontal and vertical dimensions undermines not just women, but it threatens the future success of the advertising industry itself.

National Cultural Dimensions. We now turn to the final research question. What are the relationships, if any, between female creatives'

horizontal and vertical proportions and national cultural dimensions? When meshing the four Hofstede dimensions and the six GLOBE dimensions nine countries were removed from the national cultural dimensions analysis. This resulted in 41 countries being included in the cultural dimensions analysis, which nonetheless represents a highly diverse sample.

Among the Hofstede and GLOBE cultural dimensions used, when applying Pearson correlations, there appears to be no correlation with the horizontal gender distributions at the global level. However, there is a positive relationship between the global vertical distribution and GLOBE assertiveness value dimension ($r=.44$, $p<.005$). When looking at the country data by region, correlations appear for the combination of all the Western countries. The correlations can be seen in Figure 2 where the percentage of female creatives in the Western world is positively correlated with UAI of the Hofstede model ($r=.51$, $p<.05$), in-group collectivism ($r=.43$, $p<.05$), and negatively correlated with performance orientation ($r=-.52$, $p<.05$), future orientation ($r=-.52$, $p<.05$) and uncertainty avoidance ($r=-.54$, $p<.05$) of the GLOBE model. On the other hand, the percentage of female CDs for 22 Western countries correlates negatively with GLOBE's assertiveness practice dimension ($r=-.45$, $p<.05$).

In the end, the study found no correlation between horizontal and vertical distribution and the above cultural dimensions across all countries, but another correlation was found. Vertical female CD distribution is positively correlated with GLOBE's assertiveness value dimension. Assertiveness is generally considered a masculine trait. Thus, it is both interesting and surprising that this correlation exists. It is interesting in that assertiveness would be typical with the masculine creative department, yet surprising in that assertiveness would be considered inherently male while correlating with women. Interestingly, the practice and value score of assertiveness is negatively correlated with the current 41 countries samples. This could mean that countries with higher female CDs percentages in the creative department might be low in assertiveness practices, but actually they are inclined toward a more masculine culture.

Such correlation belies the nature of the current "gender-neutral" cultures, which in fact crave assertive, masculine behaviors. As in most Asian

countries, people tend to want more assertiveness than they currently have. On the other hand, for many Western nations, the pattern is in reverse. This becomes evident when the analysis shifted to only Western countries.

According to Minkov and Hofstede (2013), focusing on data from predominantly developed countries could yield insightful results because of the data reliability of rich nations. Thus, the sample size was collapsed to only European countries and the four major Western nations: Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the United States. From this vantage point a multitude of correlations emerge. Foremost is the negative relationship between vertical female CD distribution and the GLOBE assertiveness practice dimension. This suggests that in more assertive cultures, women are rare among creative management. It appears that while the competition and aggression in the Western nations may be highly valued in terms of performance, these same values are less socially acceptable. For creative women at the top, being competitive and dominant is welcomed in cultures with high assertiveness. Yet, cooperation and a sense of modesty are also preferred, creating a double-bind for creative women. Further, there is a negative relationship in creative women's horizontal distribution and performance orientation within these 22 Western nations. The findings strongly suggest that women, regardless of rank, are deemed less creatively productive.

Returning to Hofstede's and GLOBE's cultural dimensions, creative women's proportion is positively correlated with UAI and negatively correlated with GLOBE's uncertainty avoidance practice. Hofstede's UAI and GLOBE's uncertainty avoidance correlate negatively with one another, yet they share different concepts (de Mooij, 2013). The GLOBE dimension emphasizes in-groups rather than out-groups, while UAI stresses avoiding ambiguity, anxiety, and stress (Minkov, 2011). The shared concepts refer to "the extent to which members of collectives seek orderliness, consistency, structure, formalized procedures, and laws to cover situations in their daily lives" (House et al., 2004, p. 603). In many ways this is not surprising. Women in creative are under greater stress than their male counterparts. Further, they are not part of the in-group. While women may

Women in creative are under greater stress than their male counterparts.

screen were reading the news, while only 3% of them were reporters. Women's names appear in less than 1% (only 0.03%) of bylines in newspaper stories. See more at: http://whomakesthenews.org/articles/bangladesh-media-bias-against-women-and-rural-areas-uncovered#sthash.vmi9yCS0.dpuf

And one more item on the Global Media Monitoring Project: **GMMP has launched a Facebook page** and would like to invite you to "like" it in order to receive updates and other relevant information related to the progress of the project! https://www.facebook.com/Global.Media.Monitoring.Project

The Consortium for Media Literacy's January 2015 issue of Connections takes **a close look at feminist media advocacy,** particularly body image issues and how Hollywood empowers female characters, then hobbles them. http://consortiumformedialiteracy.org/images/NEWSLETTERS/body%20image%20and%20media%20literacy.pdf

Been following **the "No More Page 3" campaign** to persuade publishers of The Sun newspaper in Britain to drop its Page 3 photos of nearly-nude women? The beat goes on, after a brief pause in publishing Page 3 "girls" gave false hope to those who were hoping this pathetic, dated feature would be pulled. GirlTalkHQ has a wonderful writeup on the latest status of the campaign to rid Page 3 of the sexual gimmick, with great comments from those involved: http://girltalkhq.com/is-the-sun-newspaper-on-the-verge-of-ditching-sexist-page-3-section/

There's always lots of buzz about Super Bowl ads every year, but given their enormous price tag, **are they really all that effective?** Katie Delahaye Paine, who publishes a newsletter on measuring message effectiveness, is skeptical. Here's her take: http://painepublishing.com/measurementadvisor/super-bowl-ad-effectiveness-whats-penalty-oral-interference/

Here's an ad that deserves the kudos it received: Legos' ad featuring girls creating their world with its products and their ideas. *Adweek* said that ad gave welcome acknowledgement to girls' different style of play and the power of their imaginations. Here it is, with Adweek's analysis: http://www.adweek.com/news/advertising-branding/ad-day-lego-finally-makes-inspiring-empowering-tv-ad-girls-161795

desire consistency and structure, their alienation from the in-group would naturally leads to a negative correlation with GLOBE's uncertainty avoidance practice. This is confirmed by the positive correlation with women's horizontal distribution dimension and the GLOBE's in-group collectivism. Major advertising players that demonstrate a "skewed" (Kanter, 1997) gender construct in creative such as France (home to the largest multinational advertising agency in the world), Great Britain (home to the second largest multinational advertising agency in the world), and the United States (home to the most advertising agencies in the world) all reported relatively low scores of in-group collectivism and thus place less emphasis on identifying with in-groups.

Perhaps the most interesting finding is that women's horizontal distribution correlates negatively with GLOBE's future orientation. Societies with low scores in future orientation value immediate gratifications and quick results. Yet, women tend to value long-term career success. Thus, it appears that creative women's contributions are significantly undervalued. Upon realizing the dismal possibility of upward mobility within the "skewed" (Kanter, 1977) environment of advertising creative departments women, who value long-term career opportunities leave advertising creative in search of careers where they will be valued.

Conclusion

Returning to the question of why are there so few women creating the messaging, this study suggests that advertising creative departments across the globe marginalize female creatives. This marginalization, in effect minimizes creative women's ability to effectively participate in the creation of advertising messaging.

Based on hard quantitative evidence using multidimensional models, this study definitively demonstrates creative women's proportional scarcity with advertising creative departments across the world. Women make up only 20.3% of all creatives in advertising globally. Further, women represent only 14.6% of all creative directors, making them tokens in a man's world and a scarce global commodity. Finally, multiple cultural dimension correlations with the distribution data have provided strong statistical support, suggesting that there is a systemic global culture within advertising creative departments that undermines creative women's ability to succeed. There are a few limitations, including that Red Books data is concentrated in industrial countries and is self-reported, a snapshot in time, and this study is the

first to combine the Hofstede and GLOBE models. Nonetheless, Red Books represents the industry's own data. Thus, it is safe to say that these conclusions are not without a basis.

Advertising is a cultural industry where cultural dimensions matter greatly. Thus, we conclude with the words of one female Swedish CD, "We in advertising are not modern; we just think we are." It is time to modernize advertising. It is time to value creative women. In doing so advertising will be positioned as an industry that is truly modern and leaning into the future – a future where great ideas are not lost because of gendered marginalization.

References

Advertising Age (2005). Six Year Retrospective: Employment and Pay by Gender, 2000-2005. New York, NY. Retrieved July 7, 2013 from http://www.adage.com/page.cms?pageId=1183

Alvesson, M. (1998). Gender relations and identity at work: A case study of masculinities and femininities in an advertising agency. Human Relations, 51(8), 969-1005.

Broyles, S. J., & Grow, J. M. (2008). Creative women in advertising agencies: Why so few "babes in boyland"? Journal of Consumer Marketing, 25(1), 4-6.

Dahlerup, D. (1988). From a small to a large minority: women in Scandinavian politics. Scandinavian Political Studies, 11(4), 275-298.

de Mooij, M. (2013). On the misuse and misinterpretation of dimensions of national culture. International Marketing Review, 30 (3), 253-261.

de Mooij, M., & Hofstede, G. (2010). The hofstede model applications to global branding and advertising strategy and research. International Journal of Advertising, 29(1), 85-110.

EECO. (2009). 2007 EEO-1 National Aggregate Report by NAICS-5 Code: 54181 - Advertising Agencies. The U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Retrieved July 22, 2013 from http://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/statistics/employment/jobpat-eeo1/2007/nac5/54181-Advertising%20Agencies.html

Ely, R. J. (1990). The Role of Men in Relationships among Professional Women. Best Papers Proceedings of the Academy of Management, 364-368. San Francisco: Academy of Management.

Ely, R. J. (1995). The power in demography: Women's social constructions of gender identity at work. Academy of Management journal, 38(3), 589-634.

Endicott, R. C., & Morrison, M. (2005). Growing agencies eye 4% to 6% raises. Advertising Age, 76(49).

Flewellen K. J., Broyles S. J. & Grow, J. M. (2011). Women to Watch Speak Out: Looking Behind the Curtain of Mentoring, Networking and Gender. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, Renaissance Grand & Suites Hotel, St. Louis, MO.

Gregory, M. R. (2009). Inside the locker room: male homosociability in the advertising industry. Gender, Work & Organization, 16 (3), 323-347.

Grow, J. M., & Broyles, S. J. (2011). Unspoken rules of the creative game: insights to shape the next generation from top advertising creative women. Advertising & Society Review, 12(1).

Grow, J., Roca, D., & Broyles, S. (2012). Vanishing acts creative women in spain and the united states. International Journal of Advertising, 31(3), 657-679.

Guy, M. E. (1994). Organizational architecture, gender and women's careers. Review of Public Personnel Administration, 14(2), 77-90.

Hofstede, G. (2001). Culture's Consequences. 2nd ed., Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.

House, R., Quigley, N., & de Luque, M. (2010). Insights from project GLOBE extending global advertising research through a contemporary framework. International Journal of Advertising, 29(1), 111-139.

House, Robert J., et al. (2004). Culture, Leadership, and Organizations, The GLOBE Study of 62 Societies, Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.

Ibarra, H. (1997). Paving an alternative route: Gender differences in managerial networks. Social Psychology Quarterly, 91-102.

IPA (2012). Agency Census 2012. Institute of Practitioners in Advertising. Retrieved July 22, 2013 from http://www.ipa.co.uk:80/Document/Agency-Census-2012&monetised=False&viewable=2

Kanter, R. M. (1977). Some Effects of Proportions on Group Life: Skewed Sex Ratios and Responses to Token Women. American Journal of Sociology. 82, 965-990. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/2777808

Klein, D. (2000). Women in Advertising - 10 Years on: Finding and Recommendations. Study commissioned by the Institute of Practitioners in Advertising (IPA). London.

Lemons, M. A. (2003). Contextual and cognitive determinants of procedural justice perceptions in promotion barriers for women. Sex Roles, 49(5-6), 247-264.

Keep current between issues with MEDIA REPORT TO WOMEN'S BLOG!

▼▼▲▼▼▲

MRTW Editor Sheila Gibbons posts news and commentary regularly with links to developments as they happen! Save it to your favorites and follow us!

www.mediareporttowomentheblog.blogspot.com

Mager, J., & Helgeson, J. G. (2011). Fifty years of advertising images: Some changing perspectives on role portrayals along with enduring consistencies. Sex Roles, 64(3-4), 238-252.

Mallia, K. L. (2009a). Creativity Knows No Gender, but Agency Creative Departments Sure Do. Advertising Age. Retrieved July 17, 2013 from http://adage.com/article/talentworks/advertising-motherhood-mix-creative-directing/138709/

Mallia, K. (2009). Rare birds: why so few women become ad agency creative directors. Advertising & Society Review, 10 (3).

Mallia, K. L., & Windels, K. (2011). Will changing media change the world? An exploratory investigation of the impact of digital advertising on opportunities for creative women. Journal of Interactive Advertising, 11(2), 30-44. Retrieved from http://jiad.org/article145.html

Martin-Llaguno, Marta (2007). Women in the Advertising Industry. Vertical Segregation in Commercial Communication: Glass Ceiling and Sticky Floor. Zer, 12(22). University of the Basque Country, Bilbao, 429-52. Retrieved from http://www.humanrights.gov.au/sites/default/files/content/pdf/sex_discrim/glass_ceilings.pdf

Minkov, M. (2011). Cultural Differences in a Globalizing World. Emerald, Bingley.

Minkov, M., & Hofstede, G. H. (2013). Cross-Cultural Analysis: The Science and Art of Comparing the World's Modern Societies and Their Cultures / Michael Minkov; with contributions by Geert Hofstede. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE Publications.

Morrison, A. M., White, R. P., & Van Velsor, E. (1987). Breaking the Glass Ceiling: Can Women Reach the Top of America's Largest Corporations? Ann M. Morrison, Randall P.

White, Ellen Van Velsor, and the Center for Creative Leadership. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley Pub. Co., c1987.

Nixon, S. (2003). Advertising Cultures: Gender, Commerce, Creativity. London: Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE.

Pueyo A. N. (2010). Sex Structure of Occupations in the Advertising Industry: Where are the Female Ad Practitioners?. Observatorio (OBS) Journal. 4, 243-67. Retrieved from https://obs.obercom.pt/index.php/obs/article/download/416/378

Ridgeway, C. L. (1988). Gender Differences in Task Groups: A Status and Legitimacy Account. In Murray Webster, Jr. and Martha Foschi (Eds.). Status generalization: New theory and research. 188-206. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Rosener, J. B. (1990). Ways Women Lead. Harvard Business Review. 68, 119-125. Retrieved from http://hbr.org/1990/11/ways-women-lead/ar/

Sandberg, S. (2013). Lean In: Women, Work and the Will to Lead. Alfred A. Knopf, New York.

Still, L. V. (1997). Glass Ceilings and Sticky Floors Barriers to the Careers of Women in the Australian Finance Industry. Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission. Commonwealth of Australia: Australia.

The World Bank (2013). Labor Participation Rate, Female (% of Female Population Ages 15+). Retrieved July 18, 2013 from http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.CACT.FE.ZS

Windels, K. (2011). What's in a number? Minority status and implications for creative professionals. Creativity Research Journal, 23 (4), 321-329.

Windels, K., & Lee, W. N. (2012). The construction of gender and creativity in advertising creative departments. Gender in Management: An International Journal, 27(8), 502-519.

Table 1. Selected Dimensions of Culture Measurement in the Hofstede Model

Dimensions	Definitions
Power Distance (PDI)	The extent to which the less powerful members of organizations and institutions (like the family) accept and expect that power is distributed unequally. This represents inequality (more versus less). but defined from below, not from above. It suggests that a society's level of inequality is endorsed by the followers as much as by the leaders.
Individualism vs. Collectivism (IDV)	The degree to which individuals are integrated into groups. The word "collectivism" in this sense has no political meaning: it refers to the group, not to the state.
Masculinity vs. femininity (MAS)	Refers to the distribution of roles between the genders which is another fundamental issue for any society to which a range of solutions are found. The assertive pole has been called "masculine" and the modest, caring pole "feminine."
Uncertainty Avoidance (UAI)	A society's tolerance for uncertainty and ambiguity; it ultimately refers to man's search for Truth. It indicates to what extent a culture programs its members to feel either uncomfortable or comfortable in unstructured situations.

Derived from http://www.geert-hofstede.com/